

## PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES

**Date of Meeting:** Wednesday, November 12, 2008  
**Time of Meeting:** 6:00 p.m.  
**Place of Meeting:** Red Buff Community/Senior Center  
1500 South Jackson Street  
Red Bluff, CA

**Commissioners Present:** Jean Moran  
Bob Carrel  
Andrew Christ  
Doug Dale  
Greg Latourell

**Commissioners Absent:** None

**Staff Present:** Scot Timboe, Planning Director  
Cheryl Smith, Deputy City Clerk  
Mike Bachmeyer, Division Chief  
Martin J. Nichols, City Manager  
J. D. Ellison, Building Official/Director

The Pledge of Allegiance was led by Chairperson Latourell and the assemblage joined in.

### **CITIZEN'S COMMENT:**

None.

## **CURRENT BUSINESS**

### **PUBLIC HEARING ON THE FINAL ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT AND PROJECT APPLICATIONS FOR THE WAL-MART SUPERCENTER PROJECT – 608 LUTHER ROAD; APN 033-180-860; SCH No. 2004012088**

Chairperson Latourell acknowledged receipt of letters from William Kopper via FAX and John Beasely via e-mail.

City Attorney Richard Crabtree noted that Mr. Kopper had requested a continuance of the public hearing, but there was no legal reason to grant as the City has provided significant time for review.

No action was taken on Mr. Kopper's request to continue the public hearing to a future date and the Chairperson Latourell moved on to the staff report presented by Scot Timboe, Planning Director.

Scot Timboe, Planning Director, reviewed the staff report with a power point presentation and gave staff's recommendation that the Planning Commission:

1. Conduct the Public Hearing.
2. Consider all public testimony and all other information relating to this project submitted to the Commission.
3. Acknowledge and accept the PMC response memo into the project record.
4. Adopt Resolution No. 08-005, recommending to the City Council certification of the Environmental Impact Report (SCH No. 2004012088), with attached Statement of Overriding Considerations.
5. Adopt Resolution No. 08-006, recommending to the City Council approval of General Plan Land Use Map Amendment (GPA-03-002) and Rezoning of the Zoning Map (Ord. No. 992; Readopting Rez 194), with attached map diagrams.
6. Adopt Resolution No. 08-007, recommending to the City Council approval of Design Review (DRG-04-02-15), Tree Replacement Plan (TRP-04-02-15), with attached Conditions of Approval, Mitigation Measures, and reduced project plans.

Mr. Timboe reported that the building had been reduced in size by approximately 16%, a heritage tree had been saved and a screen wall would be extended on Reeds to the Mill Street intersection.

Chairperson Latourell opened the public hearing at 6:25 p.m.

Shell MacPherson, PacLand, gave a brief power point presentation reviewing the changes that had been made to the building, which included the scaled down building and the eliminated seasonal sales area in the parking lot. He requested time be reserved to respond to issues and comments made during the public hearing.

Steve Cogner, concerned citizen, spoke in favor of the project. Mr. Cogner lives in the area and he does not see a good argument against this location. He feels that the intersection of Oak, Antelope and Main is worst than the So. Jackson Street intersection.

Ron Fortenberry, Bethel Assembly, stated that he doesn't oppose the project as it would be wonderful for the City. His concern was for the church's new parking lot egress and ingress.

Ken Sanford, concerned citizen, spoke in favor of the project and asked when it would be built. He also stated that with three docks there would not be that much noise, as the tractors would leave the trailers at the dock and leave. When you go by the current Wal-Mart they might be two trailers there, but not the tractors.

Richard Clapp, Citizens for a Healthy Community, expressed his concerns with traffic and stated that he did not feel it had been dealt with. He did not understand why the trucks entry is in the area of where the most residences were located or why they couldn't enter from Mill Street. He stated that a site on Montgomery Road would be a better site and visible from the freeway.

Lamar Bayles, concerned citizen, spoke in favor of the project. He also stated that he had spoken with Former Fire Chief Gray and that the lights would allow more control for Fire, Police and ambulances when responding to emergencies in this area.

Harriett Baluk, concerned citizen, stated that Wal-Mart was a great retailer and employer, but the present location is not suitable for this store. She also questioned the impact it would have on sewer and water services and how the old building would be used.

Roy Copeland, concerned citizen, stated that he couldn't understand why they would build that large of a building in that area. He felt this is a bad area with the traffic congestion. He would like to see traffic concerns addressed and also would like time to study the project.

Brian Brennan, concerned citizen, stated that he did not want this project in that area. He also wanted to know if it was the community or Arkansas that benefited by this project. He questioned what would happen to the old store, if Wal-Mart got tax breaks, how many of the jobs were fulltime with living rate and benefits and why the Montgomery Road site was not looked at.

Julie Ellison, Wal-Mart Store Manager, stated that 70% of the employees are fulltime and that the store is currently staffed at capacity. The average wage is \$11.52 hour. She stated that they are building a larger store for convenience and to care for the people who shop there.

Wilkie Talbert, concerned citizen, expressed his concerns with the number of safety calls in the area, replacing the grassy meadows with asphalt; that health care services are not provided to employees and the traffic issues in the area. He continued by saying that sometimes employees are made to work unpaid overtime and expressed his concerns with damage to the existing grocery stores.

Brandon Tandy, Wal-Mart Distribution Center, thanked the Planning Commission for their review of this project. He encouraged the Planning Commission to vote for the project and the issues have been addressed and that some comments made were simply untrue.

Mr. Guzman, concerned citizen, stated that he was not against the project, just the location.

A concerned citizen stated that they live at Luther and Paskenta and that no matter where Wal-Mart is situated there will be an increase of traffic in that area. Wal-Mart will not make any difference in the increase of traffic in this area, eventually traffic issues will have to be addressed all over town.

CK Jackson, concerned citizen, spoke in favor of the project. He stated that the downtown area is coming along, it was not dying and that he has friends in Portland that come to Red Bluff to purchase antiques for their store in Portland. He questioned if the College was required to redo Diamond Avenue and stated that a traffic light will help in this area.

Steve German, concerned citizen, stated that no matter where the store is put someone will not want it there and stated that he works at Wal-Mart and gets paid good wages.

Patricia Houck Talbert, concerned citizen, expressed her concern for the children who ride their bikes to school, skateboards along Jackson Street and the traffic from parents picking up their children. She stated that she did not believe that Wal-Mart had given an adequate count on the number of trucks coming in. She also questioned why Wal-Mart should be given tax breaks; why not provide this tax breaks to small business.

John Ellison, Wal-Mart employee, stated that Wal-Mart has excellent benefits for all its employees whether fulltime or part-time. They paid \$7.50 biweekly for affordable and great benefits.

Sue Sergeant, concerned citizen, stated that she support the supercenter. She recently moved here and currently shops' out of town, but would shop at the supercenter if it was here.

Chairperson Latourell called for a 10 minute recess at 7:35 p.m.

Chairperson Latourell reconvened the meeting at 7:45 p.m.

Shell MacPherson, PacLand, reported that this site had under gone a considerable amount of traffic analysis, as Wal-Mart is concerned and wants to be sure that the reports are accurate. He reported that the City and Wal-Mart had met on traffic mitigations and that Wal-Mart agreed to go above and beyond what was required. They agreed to fix the problem at Jackson and Luther Road where they will install a signal, but they can not add any additional lanes. This site was identified by the City as commercial may years ago. This site is ideally located for other retail in the area, (Walgreens etc.) and as an anchor store will bring additional businesses. All studies were done by considering two operating Wal-Mart stores in addition to Raleys etc. Wal-Mart has agreed to mitigate traffic impacts of approximately 2 million dollars. The currently building has been spoken for.

Chairperson Latourell closed the Public Hearing at 7:55 p.m.

Commissioner Carrel requested clarification on whether there were provision that addressed the heritage oak and keeping it healthy. He also requested clarification on where the storm drainage dropped off into.

Mr. Timboe stated that in regards to the tree there were specially designed elements that will not damage the root of the tree and that the storm drainage parallels Mill and James Streets and dumps into Reeds Creek.

Commissioner Carrel complimented Wal-Mart for addressing the parking issues.

Commissioner Moran requested clarification on plans for the existing building.

Mr. MacPherson stated that the property is under contract with a buyer and will be sold when the doors close on the existing store. The timeline for this project is that apply for permit in mid to late 2009 with construction of 10-12 months.

Commissioner Dale stated that this land has been zoned for this type of business for a long time. He appreciated comments from people who had concerns and complimented Mr. Timboe on listening and making upgrades and changes to the supercenter to make it more compatible.

Chairperson Latourell requested clarification on whether the buyer of the current building plans to use the building as a business or if it would sit empty.

Mr. MacPherson stated that it was his understanding a business would open, but he wasn't sure how the current economy would affect the timeline.

Chairperson Latourell questioned out of the 600 fulltime and part-time employees how many would be fulltime.

Mr. MacPherson stated that he didn't have those numbers (refer to Store Manager's comment), but with 3 shifts operating 24/7 they will need a sufficient number to cover the shifts from management to mid-management to associates.

Chairperson Latourell questioned if the reduction in the store size would reduce the sales tax that the City would receive.

Mr. MacPherson stated that he didn't have that information, but demographics have more of a play than the size of the store.

Chairperson Latourell questioned if the store would have a tire and lube center.

Mr. MacPherson stated that it would not.

Chairperson Latourell requested clarification on the cost of infrastructure improvements.

Mr. Timboe stated that the infrastructure improvements will not be affected by the increased costs of materials and that Wal-Mart will have to pay at today's dollar to have the mitigations done in relationship to the construction related dollars that will be brought to Red Bluff and the area which is estimated at 10-12 million dollars.

Chairperson Latourell expressed his concerns with the traffic study as the dynamics of the area have changed and traffic is a real issue in the area. He understands that Wal-Mart didn't create the traffic but did not like the idea of adding additional issues to the area. He also stated that he did not feel this location would be good for Red Bluff.

M/S/C Dale, Moran to acknowledge and accept the PMC response memo into the project record.

AYES: Commissioners: Carrel, Christ, Dale, Latourell and Moran.

NOES: None

ABSENT OR NOT VOTING: None

M/S/C Moran, Christ to adopt Resolution No. 08-005, recommending to the City Council certification of the Environmental Impact Report (SCH No. 2004012088), with the attached Statement of Overriding Considerations with the amendment on page 5 paragraph 3 to strike Tentative Parcel Map which has already been recorded, strike Administrative Use Permit which was requested to be withdrawn by the applicant/owner

and strike parking reduction which no longer applies as the revised site plan and application complies with City of Red Bluff calculations and parking formula.

AYES: Commissioners: Carrel, Christ, Dale and Moran.

NOES: Commissioner: Latourell

ABSENT OR NOT VOTING: None

M/S/C Dale, Christ to adopt Resolution No. 08-006, recommending to the City Council approval of General Plan Land Use Map Amendment (GPA-03-002) and Rezoning of the Zoning Map (Ord. No. 992; Readopting Rez 194), with attached map diagrams.

AYES: Commissioners: Carrel, Christ, Dale and Moran.

NOES: Commissioner: Latourell

ABSENT OR NOT VOTING: None

M/S/C Moran, Dale to adopt Resolution No. 08-007, recommending to the City Council approval of Design Review (DRG-04-02-15), Tree Replacement Plan (TRP-04-02-15), with attached Conditions of Approval, Mitigation Measures, and reduced project plans.

AYES: Commissioners: Carrel, Christ, Dale and Moran.

NOES: Commissioner: Latourell

ABSENT OR NOT VOTING: None

**ADJOURNMENT:**

There being no further business the meeting was adjourned at 8:15 p.m. until November 25, 2008 at 5:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

s/ Scot Timboe  
Planning Director