

**CHARTER TOWNSHIP OF PLYMOUTH
BOARD OF TRUSTEES
REGULAR MEETING
TUESDAY, MAY 19, 2015**

MINUTES

Supervisor Price called the meeting to order at 7:10 p.m. and led in the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Shannon Price, Supervisor
Nancy Conzelman, Clerk
Ron Edwards, Treasurer
Kay Arnold, Trustee
Charles Curmi, Trustee
Robert Doroshewitz, Trustee

ABSENT: Michael Kelly, Trustee, Excused

OTHERS PRESENT: Patrick Fellrath, Director of Public Utilities
Mark Lewis, Chief Building Official
Dan Phillips, Fire Chief
Jana Radtke, Comm. Dev. Director/Planner
Thomas Tiderington, Police Chief
Kevin Bennett, Township Attorney
David Richmond, Spalding DeDecker Associates
Robert Antal, Police Lieutenant
Susan Vignoe, Solid Waste & Public Serv. Coordinator
Alice Geletzke, Recording Secretary
26 Members of the Public

D. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Regular Meeting - Tuesday, May 19, 2015

Mr. Price asked that Item G.1, Public Hearing on Application of Federal Mogul Corp., be moved prior to Item F, Public Comment; and that Item J.5, SAD, Plymouth Commons Sub, be moved prior to Item J.1, Contract Award.

Moved by Mr. Curmi and seconded by Ms. Arnold to approve the agenda for the Board of Trustees regular meeting of May 19, 2015 as amended.

Mr. Doroshewitz asked that Item J.3, 2015 General Fund Amendment, be postponed for further study of the audit reports.

The amendment to the motion was accepted by the maker, Mr. Curmi; however, Ms. Arnold, the supporter, asked that the possibility of postponement be made during discussion of the item, rather than removal from the agenda, to which Mr. Doroshewitz agreed.

Vote on original motion: Ayes all.

**CHARTER TOWNSHIP OF PLYMOUTH
BOARD OF TRUSTEES
REGULAR MEETING
TUESDAY, MAY 19, 2015**

MINUTES

E. APPROVAL OF CONSENT AGENDA

- E.1 **Approval of Minutes:**
Regular Meeting - April 21, 2015
Special Meeting - April 30, 2015
- E.2 **Acceptance of Utility Easements:**
- E.3 **Acceptance of Communications, Resolutions, Reports:**
Building Report - April 2015
Fire Department Report - April 2015
Comcast Letter
- E.4 **Approval of Township Bills:**

		Year 2015
General Fund	(101)	\$ 886,084.70
Solid Waste Fund	(226)	140,355.32
Improvement Revolving Fund (Capital Projects)	(246)	2,200.00
Drug Forfeiture Fund	(265)	8,224.05
Golf Course Fund	(510)	1,811.79
Water and Sewer Fund	(592)	408,250.00
Trust and Agency Fund	(701)	650.00
Police Bond Fund	(702)	9,289.00
Tax Fund	(703)	-0-
Special Assessment Fund	(805)	12,392.20
Total:		\$1,469,257.06

Mr. Doroshewitz commented on the content of the minutes, including the minutes of April 30, Page 11, where he asked about the legal bills, as well as credit card bills and detailed finances of the golf course.

Moved by Ms. Conzelman and seconded by Ms. Arnold to approve the consent agenda for the Board of Trustees regular meeting of May 19, 2015.

AYES: Doroshewitz, Curmi, Conzelman, Arnold, Edwards, Price
 NAYS: None
 ABSENT: Kelly

G. PUBLIC HEARING

- 1) Application of Federal-Mogul Corporation for Industrial Facilities Exemption Certificate - **Resolution 2015-05-19-18**

**CHARTER TOWNSHIP OF PLYMOUTH
BOARD OF TRUSTEES
REGULAR MEETING
TUESDAY, MAY 19, 2015**

MINUTES

Mr. Scott Pepin, Vice-President, Global Human Resources, Powertrain, addressed the Board and answered questions.

Mr. Price opened the public hearing at 7:25 p.m.

A resident, a Ford Motor Co. employee who happened to be attending the meeting, spoke in support of Federal-Mogul Corporation's application.

There being no further public comment, the hearing was closed at 7:29 p.m.

Moved by Ms. Conzelman and seconded by Mr. Curmi to approve Resolution 2015-05-19-18 for Federal Mogul Corporation for a twelve (12) year Industrial Facility Tax Exemption Certificate for real and personal property improvements located at 47001 Port Street, Plymouth Township, Wayne County, Michigan.

AYES: Arnold, Conzelman, Curmi, Doroshewitz, Edwards, Price
NAYS: None
ABSENT: Kelly

A copy of the Resolution is on file in the Clerk's office for public perusal.

F. PUBLIC COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS

Harry Jachym spoke on the topic of the Township's quick response to his sewer problem and Joanne Lamar expressed concern regarding the effect of tree removal on the park bat population as mosquito control. Treasurer Edwards explained the timing of the tree removal and described the presence of a robust bat population at the park.

H. COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

- 1) Request for Board Action - Approve the Updated Charter Township of Plymouth Master Plan for Land Use - **Resolution 2015-05-19-17**

Jana Radtke, Community Development. Director/Planner, reviewed the Planning Commission procedure for their approval of the updated Master Plan for Land Use.

Moved by Ms. Arnold and seconded by Ms. Conzelman to approve Resolution 2015-05-19-17, to approve the updated Charter Township of Plymouth Master Plan for Land Use

AYES: Arnold, Conzelman, Curmi, Doroshewitz, Edwards, Price
NAYS: None
ABSENT: Kelly

**CHARTER TOWNSHIP OF PLYMOUTH
BOARD OF TRUSTEES
REGULAR MEETING
TUESDAY, MAY 19, 2015**

MINUTES

A copy of the Resolution is on file in the Clerk's office for public perusal.

I. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

J. NEW BUSINESS

- 5) Request for Board Action - Special Assessment District - Plymouth Commons Subdivision

Rhett Gronevelt of OHM Advisors addressed the Board and answered questions regarding the project.

Moved by Ms. Conzelman and seconded by Ms. Arnold to authorize the engineering firm of OHM Advisors to provide preliminary engineering required to establish the level of improvements, location, and estimate of cost for the road rehabilitation of Plymouth Commons Subdivision as submitted and described on the received petitions for a cost not to exceed Seven Thousand Dollars (\$7,000.00). The scope of work for the above shall include:

- 1. Procure a qualified agent to conduct the necessary geotechnical engineering study for the project. Costs for this portion of the study are to be paid for separately.
- 2. Take preliminary grade shots and/or prepare preliminary cross section of rehabilitation method showing improvement location and proposed SAD.
- 3. Meetings with Wayne County to review preliminary plan, cross sections and other information.
- 4. Prepare preliminary cost estimate for project.
- 5. Any and all activities needed to proceed with the Public Hearing of Necessity.

AYES: Arnold, Conzelman, Curmi, Doroshewitz, Edwards, Price

NAYS: None

ABSENT: Kelly

- 1) Request for Board Action - Contract Award - Residential Refuse, Recycling and Yard Waste Services

Patrick Fellrath, Director of Public Utilities, and Mary Jo Van Natter of Rizzo Environmental Services addressed the Board and answered questions regarding the bid procedure, service options, and conducting a short resident survey to gather data on cart size preferences. Trustee Doroshewitz objected to voting on this matter so quickly and strongly recommended postponing the decision on vendors until the June meeting. Trustee Arnold, Treasurer Edwards, and Supervisor Price indicated no objection to postponing the vote. Ms. Conzelman noted that Rizzo is by far the lowest bidder, no matter which service option is ultimately supported by residents, so postponement would not result in any different vendor choice, although she would be fine with postponing the vote. Ms. Van Natter confirmed that postponing the vote would not jeopardize Rizzo's ability to begin service in

**CHARTER TOWNSHIP OF PLYMOUTH
BOARD OF TRUSTEES
REGULAR MEETING
TUESDAY, MAY 19, 2015**

MINUTES

September. In addition to bid specifications, contract terms and other background material, board members were presented with the following Bid Tab:

**BID TAB
Residential Refuse, Recycling and Yard Waste Services
For Bids Due May 12, 2015**

SERVICE OPTION 1	YEAR	CURRENT	ADVANCED DISPOSAL	DUNCAN BASE	REPUBLIC BASE BID	RIZZO SERVICES	WASTE MANAGEMENT BASE BID
SAME AS EXISTING SERVICES; NON-AUTOMATED WEEKLY COLLECTION OF REFUSE, RECYCLING AND YARD WASTE	1	10.83	\$15.98	\$16.15	\$17.38	\$11.99	\$12.53
	2		\$16.29	\$16.50	\$17.93	\$11.99	\$12.84
	3		\$16.61	\$16.92	\$18.49	\$12.02	\$13.16
	4		\$16.93	\$17.45	\$19.07	\$12.02	\$13.49
	5		\$17.25	\$17.97	\$19.65	\$12.02	\$13.83
	6		\$17.59	\$18.52	\$20.26	\$12.45	\$14.17
	7		\$17.93	\$19.08	\$20.87	\$12.45	\$14.53
AVERAGE			\$16.94	\$17.51	\$19.09	\$12.13	\$13.51

SERVICE OPTION 2	YEAR	CURRENT	ADVANCED DISPOSAL	DUNCAN BASE	REPUBLIC BASE BID	RIZZO SERVICES	WASTE MANAGEMENT BASE BID
AUTOMATED WEEKLY COLLECTION OF REFUSE WITH 95/96 GAL OR 64/65 GAL CART; AND AUTOMATED BI- WEEKLY COLLECTION OF RECYCLABLES WITH 95/96 GAL CART; AND NON-AUTOMATED WEEKLY COLLECTION OF YARD WASTE	1	N/A	\$14.59	\$16.18	\$17.12	\$13.25	\$14.84
	2		\$14.87	\$16.54	\$17.66	\$13.25	\$15.21
	3		\$15.15	\$16.96	\$18.20	\$13.28	\$15.59
	4		\$15.44	\$17.48	\$18.77	\$13.28	\$15.98
	5		\$15.74	\$18.00	\$19.34	\$13.28	\$16.38
	6		\$16.04	\$18.55	\$19.94	\$13.72	\$16.79
	7		\$16.35	\$19.12	\$20.55	\$13.72	\$17.21
AVERAGE			\$15.45	\$17.55	\$18.80	\$13.40	\$16.00

SERVICE OPTION 3	YEAR	CURRENT	ADVANCED DISPOSAL	DUNCAN BASE	REPUBLIC BASE BID	RIZZO SERVICES	WASTE MANAGEMENT BASE BID
AUTOMATED WEEKLY COLLECTION OF REFUSE WITH 95/96 GAL OR 64/65 GAL CART; AND AUTOMATED BI- WEEKLY COLLECTION OF RECYCLABLES WITH 64/65 GAL CART; AND NON-AUTOMATED WEEKLY COLLECTION OF YARD WASTE	1	N/A	\$15.04	\$18.28	\$17.38	\$13.25	\$14.84
	2		\$15.33	\$18.68	\$17.89	\$13.25	\$15.21
	3		\$15.62	\$19.15	\$18.48	\$13.28	\$15.59
	4		\$15.91	\$19.74	\$19.05	\$13.28	\$15.98
	5		\$16.22	\$20.33	\$19.63	\$13.28	\$16.38
	6		\$16.53	\$20.95	\$20.24	\$13.72	\$16.79
	7		\$16.85	\$21.59	\$20.86	\$13.72	\$17.21
AVERAGE			\$15.93	\$19.82	\$19.08	\$13.40	\$16.00

Moved by Mr. Curmi to postpone the Contract Award for Residential Refuse, Recycling and Yard Waste Services to the next meeting.

Motion died for lack of support.

Moved by Ms. Conzelman and seconded by Ms. Arnold to accept the low bid for Residential Refuse, Recycling and Yard Waste Services for the Charter Township of Plymouth as submitted by Rizzo Environmental Services, Inc., as described in their Bid submitted on May 12, 2015, and authorize the Supervisor and Clerk to sign the attached Contract between the Township and Rizzo Environmental Services, Inc., said contract being consistent with the accepted Bid documents, provided the following conditions are met: (1) a resident survey is conducted to gather data on cart size preference and help determine service option and (2) Rizzo Environmental Services, Inc., meets all submittal requirements for contract award.

**CHARTER TOWNSHIP OF PLYMOUTH
BOARD OF TRUSTEES
REGULAR MEETING
TUESDAY, MAY 19, 2015**

MINUTES

It was agreed by the maker and supporter to amend clause (1) of the motion to clarify that it is the Township's responsibility to conduct the resident survey, the amended clause (1) to read as follows: "that the Charter Township of Plymouth will conduct a resident survey to gather data on cart size preference and help determine service option, and".

AYES: Doroshewitz, Conzelman, Arnold, Edwards, Price
NAYS: Curmi
ABSENT: Kelly

Motion carried.

- 2) Request for Board Action - Contract Award - Landscape Maintenance Services for DDA Streetscape - West Phase

Moved by Mr. Curmi and seconded by Ms. Arnold to award the 3-year Landscape Maintenance Service Agreement for the West Phase of the DDA Streetscape to Infinitely Green Landscaping in the amount of \$22,620.00 per year, and further move to award the snow removal services for the West Phase of the DDA Streetscape to Infinitely Green Landscaping in the amount of \$180.00 per snow/ice event.

AYES: Curmi, Doroshewitz, Conzelman, Arnold, Edwards, Price
NAYS: None
ABSENT: Kelly

- 3) Request for Board Action - 2015 General Fund Amendment –
Resolution 2015-05-19-19

The request included adding a Director of Parks and Grants in the Supervisor's department and a part-time Administrative Assistant in the Clerk's department.

Trustee Doroshewitz strongly objected to wording of the "Background" section of the Staff Request, asserting that it is inconsistent with prior organizational charts contained in prior Comprehensive Annual Financial Reports (CAFERs) showing organizational responsibility for parks falling under someone other than the Treasurer. The "Background" section of the Staff Request provided as follows:

BACKGROUND: On September 28, 2010, the Board of Trustees passed Resolution 10-09-28-31, adopting the 2010 Community Park, Recreation, Open Space and Greenway Plan. Due to the financial downturn, as part of the 2010 Plan, Treasurer Edwards committed to overseeing the maintenance and improvements at the parks, coordinating directly with the Supervisor. These responsibilities were over and above his responsibilities as Township Treasurer, at no additional compensation, thus saving the Township hundreds of thousands of dollars in the intervening years. The proposed Director of Parks and Grants position would be responsible for managing the Plymouth

**CHARTER TOWNSHIP OF PLYMOUTH
BOARD OF TRUSTEES
REGULAR MEETING
TUESDAY, MAY 19, 2015**

MINUTES

**Township Parks, Hilltop Golf Course and Grant Application and Management,
and report to the Supervisor.**

Clerk Conzelman indicated that organizational charts in recent CAFERs depict park maintenance, improvements and golf course as the responsibility of the Treasurer. Trustee Doroshewitz also objected to the position description, the need for a full time person, the salary and also felt that posting the position for 10 days was inadequate. Supervisor Price indicated that the parks and recreation duties alone require substantial time, in addition to working with all departments including police, fire and DPS on grant opportunities, and SEMCOG on sidewalk grant opportunities, etc. Treasurer Edwards indicated that prior to 2008, there were two full time people making mid-\$50K and \$38K respectively, and three part time people. At that time, the Township had a contractor cutting the grass at all Township facilities at a cost of mid to high 40's. Treasurer Edwards said that by 2009, both full timers had retired, and were not replaced due to the financial downturn. The contractor was also eliminated and seasonal employees were brought in to cut the grass and care for the park. Doing this saved the Township \$100,000 each year. Treasurer Edwards said there are a lot of hours to be put in and considerable work to be done out at the park particularly from April through October and when the seasonal employees leave, the park director will have to still ensure that maintenance of the park and facilities continues throughout the year.

On the budget amendment pertaining to the part time administrative position in the Clerk's office, Ms. Conzelman indicated that she did not fill this position when it became vacant in November 2012, in order to assess whether or not it was needed. The number of special elections being called, in addition to the regular election cycle, has resulted in the need for part time administrative assistance.

It was moved by Ms. Arnold and seconded by Mr. Edwards to approve **Resolution 2015-05-19-19**, amending the 2015 General Fund Budget.

AYES: Arnold, Edwards, Conzelman, Price
NAYS: Curmi, Doroshewitz

Motion carried.

A copy of the Resolution is on file in the Clerk's office for public perusal.

- 4) Request for Board Action - Amended 2015 Improvement Revolving Fund
Resolution 2015-05-19-20

Mr. Edwards explained the amendment is for the unexpended park project funds from 2014, with \$500,000 being brought forward.

Moved by Ms. Conzelman and seconded by Mr. Edwards to approve Resolution 2015-05-15-20 adopting the Amended Improvement Revolving Fund Budget for 2015.

**CHARTER TOWNSHIP OF PLYMOUTH
BOARD OF TRUSTEES
REGULAR MEETING
TUESDAY, MAY 19, 2015**

MINUTES

AYES: Conzelman, Edwards, Arnold, Curmi, Price
NAYS: Doroshewitz

Motion carried.

A copy of the Resolution is on file in the Clerk's office for public perusal.

K. SUPERVISOR AND TRUSTEE COMMENTS

Mr. Doroshewitz requested the Board set a policy for inclusion of community events in the E-News. He objected to the non-inclusion of the PARC swimming program schedule.

Mr. Curmi had questions regarding sidewalk repair and the RFP for redesign of the website. He also asked to see drafts of the newsletters before they are sent.

Ms. Conzelman congratulated the PCEP high school radio station (88.1 The Park) on their fine work and many awards and wished good luck to all the graduating seniors from that program.

Mr. Edwards gave an update on pavilion work, park sidewalk repair, and sprayscape work.

Mr. Price commented on the sound system, E-news, meeting on sidewalk repair, and meetings with the Council on Aging and status of City of Plymouth's outstanding balance on the dispatch contract, and the legacy costs owed to the Township from the dissolution of the joint fire agreement.

L. PUBLIC COMMENTS

Bryan Bentley spoke on the topic of having public comment on the agenda after comments from the Supervisor and Trustees; Ken Garner's topics included surveys and payment of Bar Assoc. dues; Polly Wise spoke on the hole in the park being filled and then reopened, having the opportunity to ask questions of the board during meetings, and the length of time it takes for the board to move through agenda items; Susan Bondie spoke on the new park position and whether it was written for a particular person; Gloria Rodriguez supports adding the park position, questioned the salary and the different skills for parks and grant writing, tracking hours for the administrative vacancy, and public's opportunity to comment; John Maclaren spoke on how the refuse program survey results will impact the decision about which option will be chosen.

**CHARTER TOWNSHIP OF PLYMOUTH
BOARD OF TRUSTEES
REGULAR MEETING
TUESDAY, MAY 19, 2015**

MINUTES

M. ADJOURNMENT

Moved by Ms. Arnold and seconded by Mr. Edwards to adjourn the meeting at 10:36 p.m. Ayes all.

AYES: Doroshewitz, Conzelman, Arnold, Edwards, Price, Curmi
NAYS: None
ABSENT: Kelly

Nancy Conzelman, Plymouth Township Clerk