

CITY OF OAK PARK, MICHIGAN
BOARD OF REVIEW MEETING
Monday, March 11, 2019
Afternoon Session

The Board of Review convened at 12:00 p.m.

Present: **Chairperson – Herschel Goldstein;**
 Members – Zakiya Hollifield, Phyllis Mackay
 WCA Appraiser – Laurie Pettinaro

Absent: **none**

Case 1101 **52-25-19-328-006** **14611 Ludlow**

Devorah Vineburg, owner of the above listed property, appeared before the Board seeking tax relief. The Board reviewed her application for poverty exemption.

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by HOLLIFIELD:

To ACCEPT a poverty exemption

YES: GOLDSTEIN, HOLLIFIELD

Case 1102 **52-29-326-003** **23850 Moritz**

Rae Lee, owner of the above listed property, appeared before the Board seeking tax relief. The Board reviewed his application for poverty exemption.

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by HOLLIFIELD:

To ACCEPT a poverty exemption

YES: GOLDSTEIN, HOLLIFIELD

Case 1107 **52-25-29-177-017** **24240 Jerome**

Nathan Holdings, owner of the above listed property appeared before the Board regarding an uncapping of his property. The transfer was between related parties and therefore no uncapping should have occurred.

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by HOLLIFIELD:

To RECAP the Taxable Value

YES: GOLDSTEIN, HOLLIFIELD

2019 Board of Review Minutes

March 11, 2019

Page 2

Case 1108

52-25-29-330-019

23591 Jerome

Nathan Holdings, owner of the above listed property appeared before the Board regarding an uncapping of his property. The transfer was between related parties and therefore no uncapping should have occurred.

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by HOLLIFIELD:

To RECAP the Taxable Value

YES: GOLDSTEIN, HOLLIFIELD

Case 1109

52-25-29-377-001

13191 Rosemary

Nathan Holdings, owner of the above listed property appeared before the Board regarding an uncapping of his property. The transfer was between related parties and therefore no uncapping should have occurred.

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by HOLLIFIELD:

To RECAP the Taxable Value

YES: GOLDSTEIN, HOLLIFIELD

Case 1110

52-25-30-327-010

23471 Wildwood

Nathan Holdings, owner of the above listed property appeared before the Board regarding an uncapping of his property. The transfer was between related parties and therefore no uncapping should have occurred.

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by HOLLIFIELD:

To RECAP the Taxable Value

YES: GOLDSTEIN, HOLLIFIELD

Case 1111

52-25-30-153-015

15101 Northfield

Nathan Holdings, owner of the above listed property appeared before the Board regarding an uncapping of his property. The transfer was between related parties and therefore no uncapping should have occurred.

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by HOLLIFIELD:
To RECAP the Taxable Value

YES: GOLDSTEIN, HOLLIFIELD

Case 1112 52-25-30-177-023 14540 Leslie

Nathan Holdings, owner of the above listed property appeared before the Board regarding an uncapping of his property. The transfer was between related parties and therefore no uncapping should have occurred.

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by HOLLIFIELD:
To RECAP the Taxable Value

YES: GOLDSTEIN, HOLLIFIELD

Case PP01 52-99-00-007-046 Alfa Medical

The Board was presented with an assessor's change, due to a late filed 5076 exemption form filed by the taxpayer

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by MACKAY:

To correct the 2019 assessment to \$0.

YES: GOLDSTEIN, HOLLIFIELD

Case PP02 52-99-20-000-781 The Book Beat

The Board was presented with an assessor's change, due to a late filed 5076 exemption form filed by the taxpayer

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by MACKAY:

To correct the 2019 assessment to \$0.

YES: GOLDSTEIN, HOLLIFIELD

2019 Board of Review Minutes

March 11, 2019

Page 4

Case PP03

52-99-10-930-015

Magic Jewelry

The Board was presented with an assessor's change, due to a late filed 5076 exemption form filed by the taxpayer

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by MACKAY:

To correct the 2019 assessment to \$0.

YES: GOLDSTEIN, HOLLIFIELD

Case PP04

52-99-19-010-001

Diamond Nails

The Board was presented with an assessor's change, due to a late filed 5076 exemption form filed by the taxpayer

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by MACKAY:

To correct the 2019 assessment to \$0.

YES: GOLDSTEIN, HOLLIFIELD

Case PP05

52-99-00-007-046

Royal Container

The Board was presented with an assessor's change, due to a late filed EMPP exemption form filed by the taxpayer

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by MACKAY:

To correct the 2019 assessment to \$8070.

YES: GOLDSTEIN, HOLLIFIELD

Case PP06

52-99-19-004-032

Ivan Land Law Offices

The Board was presented with an assessor's change, due to a late filed 5076 exemption form filed by the taxpayer

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by MACKAY:

To correct the 2019 assessment to \$0.

YES: GOLDSTEIN, HOLLIFIELD

2019 Board of Review Minutes

March 11, 2019

Page 5

Case PP07

52-99-00-012-041

Mane Goddess Salon

The Board was presented with an assessor's change, due to the business not being located in the city.

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by MACKAY:

To correct the 2019 assessment to \$0.

YES: GOLDSTEIN, HOLLIFIELD

Case PP08

52-99-00-015-080

Tops African Hair

The Board was presented with an assessor's change, due to a late filed 5076 exemption form filed by the taxpayer

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by MACKAY:

To correct the 2019 assessment to \$0.

YES: GOLDSTEIN, HOLLIFIELD

Case PP09

52-99-10-880-170

Cumulus Media

The Board was presented with an assessor's change, due to an amended 5076 exemption form filed by the taxpayer

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by MACKAY:

To correct the 2019 assessment to \$0.

YES: GOLDSTEIN, HOLLIFIELD

Case PP10

52-99-00-019-530

Northland Healthcare

The Board was presented with an assessor's change, due to a late filed 5076 exemption form filed by the taxpayer

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by MACKAY:

To correct the 2019 assessment to \$0.**YES: GOLDSTEIN, HOLLIFIELD**

2019 Board of Review Minutes

March 11, 2019

Page 6

Case PP11

52-99-00-018-230

Wilson

The Board was presented with an assessor's change, due to a late filed 5076 exemption form filed by the taxpayer

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by MACKAY:

To correct the 2019 assessment to \$0.

YES: GOLDSTEIN, HOLLIFIELD

Case PP12

52-99-00-018-240

Spinal Mobility

The Board was presented with an assessor's change, due to a late filed 5076 exemption form filed by the taxpayer

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by MACKAY:

To correct the 2019 assessment to \$0.

YES: GOLDSTEIN, HOLLIFIELD

The above minutes reflect the actions and findings of the Board. Detailed affidavits and investigations are on file with the Assessor's Office.

**CITY OF OAK PARK, MICHIGAN
BOARD OF REVIEW MEETING
Monday, March 11, 2019
Evening Session**

The Board of Review convened at 6:02 p.m.

Present: **Chairperson – Herschel Goldstein**
 Member – James Gulley


WCA Appraiser- Laurie Pettinaro


Absent: *Craig McCrary*

That there being no further business to come before the Board at this meeting, that the meeting be hereby adjourned at 8:00 p.m. on March 11, 2019 with the next session to begin on Tuesday, March 12, 2019 at 6:00 p.m.

YES: GULLEY, GOLDSTEIN,
NO: NONE

The above minutes reflect the actions and findings of the Board. Detailed affidavits and investigations are on file with the Assessor's Office.


James Gulley


Herschel Goldstein

CITY OF OAK PARK, MICHIGAN
BOARD OF REVIEW MEETING
Tuesday, March 12, 2019
Evening Session

The Board of Review convened at 6:02 p.m.

Present: **Chairperson – Herschel Goldstein**
 Member – James Gulley
 Member – Zakiya Hollifield
 WCA Appraiser – Laurie Pettinaro
Absent: **None**

Case 1203 **52-25-30-329-015** **14410 Elm**

Crystal Davis, owner of the above listed property, appeared before the Board seeking a hardship exemption. The Board reviewed her application and determined she did meet the qualifications.

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by GULLEY:

To GRANT the hardship application

YES: GOLDSTEIN, GULLEY NO: HOLLIFIELD

Case 1204 **52-25-30-177-008** **15011 Marlow**

Debra Carus, owner of the above listed property, appeared before the Board to protest her assessment. Petitioner stated that the property is heavily damaged and is seeking an assessment reduction.

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by HOLLIFIELD:

To ADJUST the assessment to reflect the change in value due to a sewer line failure.

YES: GOLDSTEIN, HOLLIFIELD


The above minutes reflect the actions and findings of the Board. Detailed affidavits and investigations are on file with the Assessor's Office.

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by HOLLIFIELD:

That there being no further business to come before the Board at this meeting, that the meeting be hereby adjourned at 7:30 pm on March 12, 2019.

YES: GOLDSTEIN, GULLEY, HOLLIFIELD

The above minutes reflect the actions and findings of the Board. Detailed affidavits and investigations are on file with the Assessor's Office.


Herschel Goldstein
James Gulley
Zakiya Hollifield

**CITY OF OAK PARK, MICHIGAN
BOARD OF REVIEW MEETING**

**Monday, March 25, 2019
Afternoon Session**

The Board of Review convened at 2:02 p.m.

**Present: Chairperson – Herschel Goldstein
 Member – Phyllis Mackay
 Member – Zakiya Hollifield
 WCA Appraiser – Laurie Pettinaro**

Case 2525 52-25-29-152-029 13420 Northfield

Tracy Sanders, owner of the above listed property, applied for a hardship exemption. The Board reviewed the application and determined that Ms. Sanders should be approved for a hardship exemption.

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by MACKAY:

To approve the Hardship Exemption.

YES: GOLDSTEIN, MACKAY, HOLLIFIELD

Case PP13 52-99-00-001-016 Great Lakes Packaging

The Board was presented with an assessor's change to zero, due to the business moving out in June 2018.

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by MACKAY:

To correct the assessed value to zero because the business moved out of the city

YES: GOLDSTEIN. MACKAY, HOLLIFIELD

2019 Board of Review Minutes
March 25, 2019
Page 2

Case 2528

52-25-19-152-002

25991 Harding Sq.

Mr Maryanovsky, owner of the above listed property, appeared before the Board to protest his assessment. The Board reviewed the assessor's records and determined that the record is accurate.

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by MACKAY:

To adjust the assessed value to reflect the condition of the house and market value.

YES: GOLDSTEIN, MACKAY, HOLLIFIELD

The Board of Review Afternoon Session was adjourned at 4:52 pm

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by MACKAY:

Case PP14

52-99-19-009-004

Hewson & Vanhellemont

The Board was presented with an assessor's change due to a late filed Personal Property Statement by the taxpayer.

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by MACKAY:

To accept the late filed statement, thereby adjusting the assessed and taxable values.

YES: GOLDSTEIN, MACKAY, HOLLIFIELD

Case 2529

52-25-29-452-007

23200 Geneva

Ms Macali, owner of the above listed property, appeared before the Board to protest her assessment. The Board reviewed the assessor's records.

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by MACKAY:

To affirm the assessment is fair and equitable, thereby denying the appeal.

YES: GOLDSTEIN, MACKAY, HOLLIFIELD

2019 Board of Review Minutes

March 25, 2019

Page 3

Case 2530

52-25-29-278-009

24200 Majestic

Mr. Henson, owner of the above listed property, appeared before the Board to protest his assessment. The Board reviewed the assessor's records.

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by HOLLIFIELD:

To affirm the assessment is fair and equitable, thereby denying the appeal.

YES: GOLDSTEIN, MACKAY, HOLLIFIELD

Case 2531

52-25-19-451-057

14441 Balfour

Mr. Matz, representative for Mr. Lieff, owner of the above listed property, appeared before the Board to protest the assessment. The Board reviewed the assessor's records.

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by MACKAY:

To affirm the assessment is fair and equitable, thereby denying the appeal.

YES: GOLDSTEIN, MACKAY, HOLLIFIELD

Case 2533

52-25-19-152-003

25981 Harding

Mr Luss, owner of the above listed property, appeared before the Board to protest his assessment. The Board reviewed the assessor's records.

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by HOLLIFIELD:

To reduce the assessment to reflect market value.

YES: GOLDSTEIN, HOLLIFIELD

Case 2534

52-25-31-126-016

22000 Stratford

Mr Miller, owner of the above listed property, appeared before the Board to protest his assessment. The Board reviewed the assessor's records.

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by MACKAY:

To affirm the assessment is fair and equitable, thereby denying the appeal.

YES: GOLDSTEIN, MACKAY, HOLLIFIELD

2019 Board of Review Minutes

March 25, 2019

Page 4

Case PP15

52-99-00-014-043

Sneaker Villa

Business moved within city in 2018. Remove leasehold improvements from previous Location.

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by HOLLIFIELD:

To adjust the assessment based on no leasehold improvements.

YES: GOLDSTEIN, MACKAY, HOLLIFIELD

Case PP16

52-99-00-018-110

Michigan Int'l Prep School

The Board was presented with an assessor's change to zero, due to the business operating as A public school and therefore being exempt.

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by MACKAY:

To correct the assessed value to zero because the business is exempt.

YES: GOLDSTEIN, MACKAY, HOLLIFIELD

Case V001

52-25-29-253-016

Tony Lyons- 24301 Seneca

Mr Lyons, owner of the above listed property is a 100% disabled veteran and is entitled to a Veterans Exemption.

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by MACKAY:

To grant the Veterans Exemption for 2019 and correcting the AV/TV to zero.

YES: GOLDSTEIN, MACKAY, HOLLIFIELD

Case LT01

52-25-32-104-001

13401 Nine Mile- NOW Partnership

NOW Partnership, owner of the above listed property, submitted a letter appeal before the Board to protest their assessment. The Board reviewed the evidence and assessor's records.

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by HOLLIFIELD:

To affirm the assessment is fair and equitable, thereby denying the appeal.

YES: GOLDSTEIN, MACKAY, HOLLIFIELD

The Board of Review Afternoon Session was adjourned at 4:57 pm

Motion by GOLDSTEIN, supported by MACKAY:

That there being no further business to come before the Board at this meeting, that the meeting be hereby adjourned at p.m. on March 25, 2019.

YES: GOLDSTEIN, MACKAY, HOLLIFIELD

The above minutes reflect the actions and findings of the Board. Detailed affidavits and investigations are on file with the Assessor's Office.


Herschel Goldstein


Phyllis MacKay


Zakiya Hollifield