

November 30, 2018

Ref: 57792.00

Mr. Adam Lougee  
Addison County Regional Planning Commission  
14 Seminary Street  
Middlebury, VT 05753



Re: Pulp Mill Bridge and Seymour Street Sidewalk  
Recommendation of Award

Dear Mr. Lougee:

The Bid Opening for the referenced project was held at the Middlebury Town Office on November 20, 2018 at 10:00 a.m. A total of four bids were received, ranging in cost from \$498,597.00 to \$577,147.85 for the Base Bid. The Engineer’s Estimate for the Base Bid was \$460,459.31. The low bid was received from Don Weston Excavating, Inc. (Weston) in the amount of \$498,597.00, which is 8.3 percent above the final Engineer’s Estimate.

VHB has conducted an analysis of the low bid to determine if a recommendation can be made to the Town of Middlebury to accept the bid. For the purposes of this bid analysis, only the construction items that were overbid by \$4,604.59 or more in cost between the extended engineer’s estimate and the extended low bid were individually analyzed. This amount represents 1.0 percent of the engineer’s estimate. Our evaluation is as follows:

Item Number: 201.10  
Item Name: Clearing and Grubbing, Including Individual Trees and Stumps  
Estimated Quantity: 1 LS

Estimated Unit Price	Extended Estimate	Low Bid Unit Price	Extended Low Bid	Low Bid Difference
\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$10,800.00	\$10,800.00	+\$5,800.00

**Explanation:** The low bid unit price is higher than the estimated unit price for this construction item by 216 percent. Bids for this item ranged from \$4,700.00 to \$32,650.00/LS. The wide range of bids is likely due to how each bidder accounted for landscaping work. Weston’s bid is the second highest for this item, but their bid on the other landscaping items such as trees and shrubs were close to the engineer’s estimate while the other bidders were much higher. The listed quantity of 1 LS has been verified for this item. Because this is a Lump Sum item, there can be no cost increase for this item. There is no advantage to the Contractor or disadvantage to the Town of Middlebury. Recommend acceptance of low bid unit price.

40 IDX Drive, Building 100  
Suite 200

Engineers | Scientists | Planners | Designers

South Burlington, Vermont 05403  
P 802.497.6100  
F 802.495.5130



---

Item Number: 616.21  
Item Name: Vertical Granite Curb  
Estimated Quantity: 1,420 LF

Estimated Unit Price	Extended Estimate	Low Bid Unit Price	Extended Low Bid	Low Bid Difference
\$34.03	\$48,322.60	\$60.00	\$85,200.00	+\$36,877.40

**Explanation:** The low bid unit price is higher than the estimated unit price for this construction item by 176 percent. Bids for this item ranged from \$33.00 to \$60.00/LF. Although Weston's bid was the highest, it was not much higher than the second or third highest, which were \$57.55/LF and \$49.54/LF, respectively. These costs may be due to a recent increase in the price of granite. It is also possible that the lowest bid of \$33.00 did not consider the work incidental to the curb installation. The listed quantity of 1,420 LF has been verified. There is no advantage to the Contractor or disadvantage to the Town of Middlebury. Recommend acceptance of low bid unit price.

---

Item Number: 630.15  
Item Name: Flaggers  
Estimated Quantity: 1,200 HR

Estimated Unit Price	Extended Estimate	Low Bid Unit Price	Extended Low Bid	Low Bid Difference
\$28.79	\$34,548.00	\$35.00	\$42,000.00	+\$7,452.00

**Explanation:** The low bid unit price is higher than the estimated unit price for this construction item by 122 percent. Bids for this item ranged from \$33.00 to \$50.00/HR. Bids for this item ranged widely, and Weston's cost was near the low end of all bids. The estimated quantity of 1,200 HR has been verified, although the final quantity can vary substantially depending on the contractor's means and methods. There is no advantage to the Contractor or disadvantage to the Town of Middlebury. Recommend acceptance of low bid unit price.

---

Item Number: 635.11  
Item Name: Mobilization/Demobilization  
Estimated Quantity: 1 LS

Estimated Unit Price	Extended Estimate	Low Bid Unit Price	Extended Low Bid	Low Bid Difference
\$27,200	\$27,200	\$38,000	\$38,000	+\$10,800



**Explanation:** The low bid unit price is higher than the estimated unit price for this construction item by 140 percent. Bids for this item ranged from \$30,062.62 to \$53,700/LS. Weston's cost was in the middle range of all bidders. The listed quantity of 1 LS has been verified for this item. Because this is a Lump Sum item, there can be no cost increase for this item. There is no advantage to the Contractor or disadvantage to the Town of Middlebury. Recommend acceptance of low bid unit price.

---

Item Number: 641.10  
Item Name: Traffic Control  
Estimated Quantity: 1 LS

Estimated Unit Price	Extended Estimate	Low Bid Unit Price	Extended Low Bid	Low Bid Difference
\$5000.00	\$5000.00	\$10,000.00	\$10,000.00	+\$5000.00

**Explanation:** The low bid unit price is higher than the estimated unit price for this construction item by 200 percent. Bids for this item ranged from \$6,010.00 to \$32,000/LS. Bids for this item ranged widely, and Weston's cost was the middle range of all bidders. The listed quantity of 1 LS has been verified. Because this is a Lump Sum item, there can be no cost increase for this item. There is no advantage to the Contractor or disadvantage to the Town of Middlebury. Recommend acceptance of low bid unit price.

---

Item Number: 900.675  
Item Name: Special Provision (Precast Concrete Gravity Retaining Wall with Railing)  
Estimated Quantity: 55 SY

Estimated Unit Price	Extended Estimate	Low Bid Unit Price	Extended Low Bid	Low Bid Difference
\$500.00	\$27,500.00	\$1,300.00	\$71,500.00	+\$44,000.00

**Explanation:** The low bid unit price is higher than the estimated unit price for this construction item by 260 percent. Bids for this item ranged from \$860.25 to \$1,407.43/SY. Bids for this item ranged widely, and Weston's cost was in the middle range of all bidders. The estimated quantity of 55 SY has been verified although it may change slightly once the fabricator has completed the final design of the wall. There is no advantage to the Contractor or disadvantage to Town of Middlebury. Recommend acceptance of low bid unit price.

Mr. Adam Lougee  
Ref: 57792.00  
Page 4 of 4  
November 30, 2018



---

**Final Recommendation:**

We noted that Weston's bid form contained no errors, and they acknowledge receipt of Addendum #1. They also included the required Non-Collusion Affidavit and EEO Certification with their bid.

A total of six items in Weston's bid were underbid by \$4,604.59 or more in cost between the extended engineer's estimate and the extended low bid, including Common Excavation, Subbase of Dense Graded Crushed Stone, Portland Cement Concrete Sidewalk (5 Inch), Special Provision (Rectangular Rapid Flashing Beacon), Special Provision (Hand-Placed Bituminous Concrete Material, Drives), and Special Provision (Bituminous Concrete Pavement, Small Quantity). VHB sees no disadvantage to Town of Middlebury regarding these lower-than-expected costs.

A review of the extended estimate/low bid of the items that had a difference of more than 1.0 percent of the Low Bid Contract Price, and the unit price assessment, did not provide any evidence that the low bid or a low bid unit price would provide an advantage to the Contractor or disadvantage to Town of Middlebury. The quantities have been back checked and verified, with no errors found. Therefore, we recommend that the low bid be accepted.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Evan P. Detrick". The signature is written in a cursive style with a prominent "E" and "D".

Evan Detrick, P.E.  
Project Manager  
[edetrick@vhb.com](mailto:edetrick@vhb.com)

cc: Chris Hunt, VTrans Project Supervisor ([chris.hunt@vermont.gov](mailto:chris.hunt@vermont.gov))

Weston Bid Tabulation								Over by 1%+
								Under by 1%+
VTrans Item #	Item	Unit	Quantity	Estimated Unit Cost	Estimate Cost	Weston Unit Cost	Weston Estimate Cost	Difference
201.10	Clearing and Grubbing, Including Individual Trees and Stumps	LS	1	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 10,800.00	\$ 10,800.00	\$ 5,800.00
201.15	Removing Medium Trees	EA	4	\$ 606.79	\$ 2,427.16	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 4,000.00	\$ 1,572.84
203.15	Common Excavation	CY	770	\$ 23.18	\$ 17,848.60	\$ 13.00	\$ 10,010.00	\$ (7,838.60)
203.16	Solid Rock Excavation	CY	6	\$ 116.77	\$ 700.62	\$ 25.00	\$ 150.00	\$ (550.62)
203.28	Excavation of Surfaces and Pavements	CY	3	\$ 30.04	\$ 90.12	\$ 100.00	\$ 300.00	\$ 209.88
203.30	Earth Borrow	CY	10	\$ 17.15	\$ 171.50	\$ 30.00	\$ 300.00	\$ 128.50
204.20	Trench Excavation of Earth	CY	42	\$ 38.65	\$ 1,623.30	\$ 20.00	\$ 840.00	\$ (783.30)
204.30	Granular Backfill for Structures	CY	5	\$ 74.63	\$ 373.15	\$ 25.00	\$ 125.00	\$ (248.15)
301.35	Subbase of Dense Graded Crushed Stone	CY	770	\$ 46.25	\$ 35,612.50	\$ 30.00	\$ 23,100.00	\$ (12,512.50)
404.65	Emulsified Asphalt	CWT	1	\$ 22.06	\$ 22.06	\$ 60.00	\$ 60.00	\$ 37.94
601.0010	15" CSP .064 (2-2/3 x 12)	LF	25	\$ 63.78	\$ 1,594.50	\$ 74.00	\$ 1,850.00	\$ 255.50
601.0015	18" CSP .064 (2-2/3 x 12)	LF	10	\$ 85.96	\$ 859.60	\$ 84.00	\$ 840.00	\$ (19.60)
601.0910	15" CPEP	LF	20	\$ 77.82	\$ 1,556.40	\$ 64.00	\$ 1,280.00	\$ (276.40)
604.20	Precast Reinforced Concrete Catch Basin With Cast Iron Grate	EA	3	\$ 3,214.21	\$ 9,642.63	\$ 2,300.00	\$ 6,900.00	\$ (2,742.63)
604.412	Rehab. Drop inlets, Catch Basins, or Manholes, Class I	EA	2	\$ 1,247.69	\$ 2,495.38	\$ 500.00	\$ 1,000.00	\$ (1,495.38)
604.415	Rehab. Drop inlets, Catch Basins, or Manholes, Class II	EA	2	\$ 1,440.89	\$ 2,881.78	\$ 750.00	\$ 1,500.00	\$ (1,381.78)
604.42	Changing Elevations of Sewer Manholes	EA	5	\$ 889.41	\$ 4,447.05	\$ 500.00	\$ 2,500.00	\$ (1,947.05)
604.55	Cast Iron Cover with Frame	EA	1	\$ 967.71	\$ 967.71	\$ 600.00	\$ 600.00	\$ (367.71)
609.10	Dust Control with Water	MGAL	5	\$ 78.43	\$ 392.15	\$ 1.00	\$ 5.00	\$ (387.15)
613.10	Stone Fill, Type I	CY	3	\$ 53.28	\$ 159.84	\$ 100.00	\$ 300.00	\$ 140.16
616.21	Vertical Granite Curb	LF	1420	\$ 34.03	\$ 48,322.60	\$ 60.00	\$ 85,200.00	\$ 36,877.40
618.10	Portland Cement Concrete Sidewalk, 5 INCH	SY	1320	\$ 72.35	\$ 95,502.00	\$ 65.00	\$ 85,800.00	\$ (9,702.00)
618.11	Portland Cement Concrete Sidewalk, 8 INCH	SY	290	\$ 92.58	\$ 26,848.20	\$ 79.00	\$ 22,910.00	\$ (3,938.20)
618.30	Detectable Warning Surface	SF	80	\$ 46.56	\$ 3,724.80	\$ 30.00	\$ 2,400.00	\$ (1,324.80)
619.20	Removing and Resetting Property Markers	EA	5	\$ 100.00	\$ 500.00	\$ 300.00	\$ 1,500.00	\$ 1,000.00
620.55	Removal of Existing Fence	LF	100	\$ 4.31	\$ 431.00	\$ 1.00	\$ 100.00	\$ (331.00)
629.20	Adjust Elevation of Valve Box	EA	9	\$ 110.93	\$ 998.37	\$ 150.00	\$ 1,350.00	\$ 351.63
629.29	Relocate Hydrant	EA	1	\$ 2,900.00	\$ 2,900.00	\$ 2,000.00	\$ 2,000.00	\$ (900.00)
630.15	Flaggers	HR	1200	\$ 28.79	\$ 34,548.00	\$ 35.00	\$ 42,000.00	\$ 7,452.00
635.11	Mobilization/Demobilization	LS	1	\$ 27,200.00	\$ 27,200.00	\$ 38,000.00	\$ 38,000.00	\$ 10,800.00
641.10	Traffic Control	LS	1	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 5,000.00
646.500	Durable Crosswalk Marking	LF	110	\$ 8.94	\$ 983.40	\$ 35.00	\$ 3,850.00	\$ 2,866.60
649.51	Geotextile for Silt Fence	SY	900	\$ 4.53	\$ 4,077.00	\$ 2.00	\$ 1,800.00	\$ (2,277.00)
651.15	Seed	LB	80	\$ 9.15	\$ 732.00	\$ 10.00	\$ 800.00	\$ 68.00
651.18	Fertilizer	LB	330	\$ 4.87	\$ 1,607.10	\$ 2.00	\$ 660.00	\$ (947.10)
651.20	Agricultural Limestone	TON	2	\$ 746.51	\$ 1,493.02	\$ 600.00	\$ 1,200.00	\$ (293.02)
651.25	Hay Mulch	TON	2	\$ 819.56	\$ 1,639.12	\$ 600.00	\$ 1,200.00	\$ (439.12)
651.35	Topsoil	CY	360	\$ 47.88	\$ 17,236.80	\$ 45.00	\$ 16,200.00	\$ (1,036.80)
653.35	Vehicle Tracking Pad	CY	15	\$ 70.12	\$ 1,051.80	\$ 40.00	\$ 600.00	\$ (451.80)
653.40	Inlet Protection Device, Type I	EA	2	\$ 172.87	\$ 345.74	\$ 150.00	\$ 300.00	\$ (45.74)

Weston Bid Tabulation								Over by 1%+
								Under by 1%+
653.55	Project Demarcation Fence	LF	2540	\$ 0.99	\$ 2,514.60	\$ 1.00	\$ 2,540.00	\$ 25.40
656.20	Evergreen Trees	EA	5	\$ 268.83	\$ 1,344.15	\$ 290.00	\$ 1,450.00	\$ 105.85
656.30	Deciduous Trees	EA	22	\$ 450.00	\$ 9,900.00	\$ 523.00	\$ 11,506.00	\$ 1,606.00
656.35	Deciduous Shrubs	EA	1	\$ 51.02	\$ 51.02	\$ 523.00	\$ 523.00	\$ 471.98
656.50	Transplanting Shrubs	EA	1	\$ 142.00	\$ 142.00	\$ 300.00	\$ 300.00	\$ 158.00
675.20	Traffic Signs, Type A	SF	29	\$ 26.74	\$ 775.46	\$ 12.00	\$ 348.00	\$ (427.46)
675.341	Square Tube Sign Post and Anchor	LF	120	\$ 14.74	\$ 1,768.80	\$ 10.00	\$ 1,200.00	\$ (568.80)
675.50	Removing Signs	EA	14	\$ 17.93	\$ 251.02	\$ 20.00	\$ 280.00	\$ 28.98
675.60	Erecting Salvaged Signs	EA	6	\$ 34.21	\$ 205.26	\$ 20.00	\$ 120.00	\$ (85.26)
900.620	Special Provision (Rectangular Rapid Flashing Beacon)	EA	2	\$ 7,000.00	\$ 14,000.00	\$ 4,200.00	\$ 8,400.00	\$ (5,600.00)
900.620	Special Provision (Precast Reinforced Concrete L-Shaped Endwall)	EA	1	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 2,200.00	\$ 2,200.00	\$ (2,800.00)
900.675	Special Provision (Precast Concrete Gravity Retaining Wall with Railing)	SY	55	\$ 500.00	\$ 27,500.00	\$ 1,300.00	\$ 71,500.00	\$ 44,000.00
900.675	Special Provision (Hand-Placed Bituminous Concrete Material, Drives)	SY	340	\$ 50.00	\$ 17,000.00	\$ 15.00	\$ 5,100.00	\$ (11,900.00)
900.680	Special Provision (Bituminous Concrete Pavement, Small Quantity)	TON	80	\$ 200.00	\$ 16,000.00	\$ 110.00	\$ 8,800.00	\$ (7,200.00)
					Engineer's Total: \$ 460,459.31	Weston's Total: \$ 498,597.00		