

From: Bill Kernan
Sent: Wednesday, December 06, 2017 3:33 PM
To: Dan Werner; Kathleen Ramsay
Subject: Chipper Recommendation
Attachments: Bid Tally.pdf; Bandit 12XP Gas.pdf; Bandit 12XP Diesel.pdf; Morbark M12R Quote.pdf; Vermeer BC1200XL Quote.pdf

In the FY18 Equipment Fund Budget \$50,000 was allocated and approved for the purchase of a wood chipper to replace our current aging machine. Bids were solicited in August and opened at the end of September with an anticipated purchase by year-end. Below are the results...

Bandit (gas)	\$37,929.42
Bandit (diesel)	\$44,583.72
Morbark (gas)	\$38,273.00
Vermeer (gas)	\$47,934.00
Salsco	No Bid
Carlton	No Bid

With a machine of this type it is extremely hard to make like comparisons in workmanship, durability, performance, etc. It was even difficult in some instances to figure out whether or not the quoted machine actually met particular specifications. Vermeer supplied the most complete quote/material package and fully met the specifications that were required in the bid. Additional communications were necessary with the other two vendors and verbal or email statements were relied upon to verify that specifications were met.

Attached is a bid tally. The majority of items that did not meet the specifications (either through direct review of the bid or verbal/written communications) are minor. However, Morbark and Bandit's diesel powered machine did not meet the minimum horsepower requirement (although by only slight margins). Morbark also does not offer an eco-friendly engine control system lowering the machine's rpm's during downtime. While the Bandit gas powered chipper did minimally meet the horse power requirement, Vermeer was by far the superior machine supplying 135 HP and surpassing Bandit's engine by an additional 46 HP equating to 34% more than Bandit (in comparison our current chipper supplies 124 HP).

Additional Notes...

- If the other suppliers would have quoted comparably horse-powered machines their bids would most likely be closer to Vermeer's.
- During initial demonstration of the Bandit machine (by VTrans) it was prone to clogging (3 times within an hour) requiring shutdown and maintenance. Productivity obviously suffers when this happens not to mention the expense of contracted traffic control when used. (It was determined later that this was due to the learning curve of the crew using new equipment and not a fault of the machine).
- Our current machine is manufactured by Vermeer and similarly powered which means a very low learning curve and better safety from the start.
- Our current chipper was manufactured in 1993 and has served us well with minimal repair/maintenance costs.
- Vermeer has long been the leader in industrial machinery supplying all kinds of equipment to Municipalities, State Agencies and Contractors alike but great strides have been taken in recent decades by other manufacturers making it a very competitive market.
- Champlain Equipment is the dealer for the Bandit machine, supplying local expertise, repair and supplies. Vermeer's closest dealer is in Albany, NY and Morbark's is in Essex Jct.

- VTrans has recently purchased several of the Bandit chippers and have been very satisfied with their performance.
- A second Bandit demonstration was arranged with factory representatives this time. The demoed machine was smaller than the one quoted with even less horsepower but had no trouble at all chipping through even large stock items. All in attendance were favorably impressed.
- A demonstration with Morbark has been requested but nothing has been scheduled yet.

Recommendation...

Morbark should be eliminated for reasons stated above and short-fallings in not meeting the bid specifications. There does not seem to be any benefit associated with the additional cost for going with the diesel powered Bandit machine. The gas powered Bandit machine or Vermeer machine would both meet the department's needs. With the lower price and local service the preferred chipper would be from Bandit. There may be some small changes in the final purchase price depending on trailer braking systems, vehicle wire harness/connections and other small details. The recommendation would be for the purchase of the Bandit 12XP Model Machine at a cost not to exceed \$40,000.

Bill Kernan
Dept. of Public Works
Director of Operations
Town of Middlebury
1020 Route 7 South
Middlebury, VT 05753
bkernan@townofmiddlebury.org
802-388-8100 ext. 298