

BOARD OF ZONING MEETING

ATOKA, TIPTON COUNTY, TENNESSEE

May 18, 2006

Atoka City Hall

6:00 p.m.

Carolyn D. Lepard
Court Reporter
2943 Littlejohn Road
Millington, Tennessee 38053
(901) 872-2172

Board Members Present

Mr. Mark E. Johnson

Mr. Bobby McDill

Carolyn D. Lepard
Court Reporter
2943 Littlejohn Road
Millington, Tennessee 38053
(901) 872-2172

MR. WILLIFORD: My name is Hal Williford.

I'm with Memphis Stone and Gravel Company. I am the President. Also with me tonight is my Executive Vice President, Mr. Bill Kelley. He is also a professional engineer, and Alan Parks our geologist, who found this resource, and with us also tonight and he'll be helping me with the presentation. Also some the property owners are here, the Smith Family, and I think the Crum family is planning on being here, too.

Memphis Stone and Gravel is up here asking for conditional use permits on the Van Cleve property which we purchased and the Crum and the Smith properties. For the Board members, and people in the audience who are not familiar with Memphis Stone and Gravel, we have been in business since 1910. We've been supplying base materials for roads and wash materials for ready mix and asphalt.

Current statistics show that it takes about ten tons a year of aggregate to basically keep up the infrastructure with today's living, and it's only going to increase in the future, so we feel like this is a great resource here for Tipton County and the town of Atoka.

The wash materials are primarily used for

ready mix, that's ready mix that's in our home foundations, it's in the patios, it's in the walkways, it's in the driveways, stuff like that, and it's also used in your commercial building, and Memphis Stone and Gravel has supplied a lot of those materials in Tipton County and Shelby County for a number of years. A small percentage goes into asphalt. Our sister company is Lehman Roberts Company. They've been in business since '39 here in the Memphis market and down in North Mississippi. That material will go to, from this location, if permitted, to our plant in Arlington and we have a future plant that's going in, in Covington, on Mueller Brass Road that we've got permitted with the City of Covington probably a couple of years ago.

We plan to be in operation now but we also plan for I-69 to be down here, but all of you-all have been reading about that. As you know, the State just doesn't have the money just yet.

Memphis Stone and Gravel is currently furnishing gravel base material for the Paul Barrett Parkway, and that's the new section between I-40 and Highway 64. We also plan to play an active role in the construction of the widening of Highway 14 and

the future I-69 when it comes down this way, and that's what a good part of this resource will be for. As you can see, we feel like this is a very valuable project to Atoka and to Tipton County. Having a natural resource so close, with the price of diesel fuel and stuff like that, bringing it in, it just brings the cost of construction materials through the roof.

We operate seven other wash facilities currently. They are in North Mississippi and Arlington. We've been a good neighbor to all of those city and counties where we currently operate. For example, in Desoto County, where we operate four facilities, they gave us a Conservationist of the Year award, and that was for our reclamation that we've done on the properties. And all of our properties that we've mined back in Shelby County have been put back to some type of good use. In fact, if you-all know where the Wal-Mart and the Sam's Store is over there on 64, that was some of our mining years ago.

So, there's been a lot of subdivisions developed. I, personally, live in a reclaimed gravel pit in Collierville, Tennessee. My house sits in

one, so we know it can be put back to good use.

Memphis Stone and Gravel plans to be a long term resident of Atoka and Tipton County. We want to be good neighbors and operate a good, responsible business, and we've proven that in the other communities where we operate now. I assure the Board that we will be good neighbors and that we'll be a good, responsible, business.

We welcome the Board, if we're approved, to come out and conduct an informal inspection or review of our property at anytime to make sure that we're meeting all the conditions that they would put upon us.

At this time I would like to turn our presentation over to Mr. Parks, and at the end of his presentation we'll be glad to answer any questions that the Board would have for us.

MR. PARKS: I'm going to make this very brief because I want to reserve most of the time for questions and answer, because I'm sure there's going to be lots of questions that I don't anticipate and what your most interested in discossing I'm not a hundred percent right now.

All this information is on the internet. If you have access to the internet you can look at

the maps that are on there. And basically the project is broken into four phases.

Phase I will be when we actually start construction on the plant. The plant site will be on the eastern side of the old Van Cleve farm, if you're familiar with that farm. Memphis Stone purchased that tract of land and we have leased two other properties, one owned by the Smith family and one owned by Kelly and Julie Crum. The plant site will probably take six months to a year to construct and what we're talking about is a gravel wash plant where we're processing the raw sand and gravel that are used for concrete.

Once we build the wash plant, we have to mine out the first area, and everything that you see in a red outline is the mined area. And what we do is we establish a source of water with a ground water well, and then we're using our old, mined out areas as a basin to recycle the wash water, okay, and that's what you're using. That's what you see, these bodies of water, they are basins that we're constructing so that we can process the sand and gravel.

Also you see other basins that will catch

the storm water, because all the storm water that hits our project, we have to capture and treat it before we can release it into the creeks, and all that is handled under a State permit.

We move all of our material with conveyors, the raw material, except a small portion of clay gravel that we just load directly onto a truck and ship out. But most of the raw material, ninety-five percent, is moved around with a conveying system, and those conveying systems are -- we could stand right next to them while they're operating and carry on a conversation. They're not very loud. But that's what you see, these roads that are going along here (indicating). They're not roads that a truck is going to be traveling. That's where the conveyors are going to be.

So the first phase is to get the plant constructed so that we can start operating and we're going to see that on the Crum property first.

And then we move into -- and let me say this, we plan on planting some trees in this area right off of Bethel Road, because our objective is to make sure that the public doesn't see us. We're going to do what we can to conceal our operations and

I'm going to talk a lot about berms. But when you hear a "berm", all that is, is a hill that we build. It's usually about eight or ten feet high and we vegetate it. So when you drive past the operation, or you look at the operation from your property, all you see is a grass hill. That helps with screening and it also helps with noise, because that berm is built up above the ground surface and our mining activity is usually fifteen to twenty foot below the ground surface, so that acts very well to control the noise.

Going on to page 2, as you can see, we've broadened the area. This is the extent of the gravel deposit that we're mining. Over here is Rosemark Estates, this is Tracy Road, and we're -- you can see we've built a berm over here in this corner so that will protect this area from noise and, hopefully, our objective, is you won't be able to see our operation. We move the material over and we've added another cell. What we're going to do is we're going to -- we're not going to send truck traffic down Tracy Road. That is not our -- we don't want that to happen. The only way that truck will be over there

is if somebody over there orders a load of sand, and that will be the only way. We're going to send truck traffic south down Miller Road and out to Mudville Road and straight over to 14. That's the way we want the truck traffic to go.

Once we mine the Crum property then we're going to start on the Smith farm and this will be the first area that we're mining over here on the Smith farm. I know many of you here today, I'm sure, live in Quail Hollow Subdivision and you have a very beautiful lake. We've been planning on how we're going to work around that lake since the day we decided this was a potential project for us. And we — first of all, the State of Tennessee is going to make sure we have a good plan in place to protect the surface water and any stream that's coming down from it, okay? That's a major objective for us, is to control any runoff that's going in there, to not contaminate this lake.

We will modify a small portion of the draining area relative to the entire draining area. When we complete Phase II, that's going to take about four years to get Phase II completed.

Now we're going into Phase III. This area

of the Smith property is what we hope to have permission to mine. We'll start over here in this side. After we get this area right here mined out (indicating), that's going to establish another cell for a process basin where we're recirculating that water. We'll start over here in this corner, and we're going to construct berms all along this edge as we're mining to limit our impact, noise impact, as well as what you see, from the people living this area.

Another way that we control our noise, the thing in the past that people can hear most about our operation was the back-up alarms. Everybody is familiar with the beep, beep, beep sound. We're using a different type of back-up alarm that we hope will make a big difference. We're seeing that already. It just uses a different sound altogether. It makes a "shu-shu-shu" sound instead of a beep, beep, beep, and that goes a long way in helping the noise. And all the equipment that we put over here, we hope to have those type of alarms installed on.

Now, as you finish mining this area, we've reclaimed the part that we've mined on the Crum farm, end-and this will be the in product, will be a lake in

this area. It's going to be on the order of twenty acres, twenty to twenty-five acres in size.

After we've mined this area then we're going to be over here on this side of the Smith farm. Again this is Quail Hollow Subdivision and we'll mine this out and we'll end up leaving two lakes here. And again, you can see the conveyor road that we're moving. We're moving this material with a conveyor system. This will be the last area that we mine and once we've mined these three little parcels out right here, that will conclude the mining on this property.

This is a picture of the final reclamation, what it will look like when we're completely finished. There will be a large lake in this area, there'll be a good sized lake here, and I know this is a lot of information to go over and if you have any questions after the meeting, we're going to have that information, you can call me, look on the web site, I'll be happy to talk to you on the phone about it in more detail.

So, this is what we hope will be the end product of all the mining activity. Relatively speaking, we move along pretty rapidly, and that is the project, the four phases of the project. And I

know it's a very quick overview. I've tried to mention some of the ways that we're going to help our neighbors in controlling noise. The material that we're mining is a naturally wet product. When it comes out of the ground it's moist, it's got moist in it. So the material itself when we're mining doesn't generate dust. The only thing that generates dust is when — the gravel roads that we may have with conveyors on them, we're got service trucks that go up and down them. Sometimes they dry-up. Everybody is familiar with gravel roads in West Tennessee. The way we control that is we use a water wagon that sprays water on it. It's a very effective means of controlling the dust.

And, you know, we're not perfect but anytime there's a problem we are responsible. And if there's dust being generated, we want to get a handle on it as quickly as possible because we don't want somebody to call, upset, because of something like that that we can control.

And that's the project, and now I just want to open it up for any questions from the Board or from the public.

CHAIRMAN JOHNSON: There are a lot of

people here tonight and for, time-wise, we're going to limit everybody to three minutes.

MR. MIKE AUSTIN: You said you're going to minimize the run-off into Quail Hollow Lake?

MR. PARK: Yes, sir.

MR. AUSTIN: I've got news for you, you're taking out three-quarters of the feed, probably, and you're going to cut down trees, which I ain't too happy about.

CHAIRMAN JOHNSON: Also, if you'll give your name.

MR. AUSTIN: I'm sorry. I'm Mike Austin and I live in Quail Hollow. I'm right behind, actually, where your berm ends. It's right along my property line, but that whole west end of that field feeds Quail Hollow Lake when it rains and you're taking that away, and you're cutting down trees which is going to, you know, help with the noise and with the dust.

MR. PARK: I'll begin and Bill Kelley, our engineer, he'll finish up this.

You are correct that some of this watershed we are going to modify.

MR. AUSTIN: Some of it, and you're going

down into the trees.

MR. PARKS: Some of it, yes, that hill where it --

MR. AUSTIN: (Interposing) Pull that back open. There you go. Thank you.

MR. PARKS: Let me get to the

MR. AUSTIN: I can see on the big map.

See, you're cutting down into them trees, and they have twenty foot gullies down there that feed that lake, we've never had a mud problem down there, and I foresee a mud problem down there.

MR. PARKS: Well, what we intend to do is we're going to install erosion control, use a variety of methods but also we're going to divert that watershed very quickly and capture any run-off that drains that way and, if necessary --

MR. AUSTIN: (Interposing) That's my problem. You're going to divert it from the lake and that feeds the lake. That's what I'm saying.

MR. PARKS: Well, this along with all of this. There's much more of that watershed than just the area that's on that hillside. I know, that in my opinion, it's not going to be enough to detrimentally affect the lake.

MR. AUSTIN: There's five feeds on that property alone that feed that lake, five. They also feed Haskin's pond, it diverts down, it "Y's" and comes into the lake, that keeps Quail Hollow Lake.

I've got a \$250,000 property back there, and it's at the north end of the lake, which is the shallow end.

If you guys divert the lake I'm going to have a swamp.

MR. PARKS: Well, again I don't think that the amount of watershed will make a drastic difference.

MR. MIKE HASKINS: Have you-all actually done a study to look at that run-off and how much water you're diverting?

MR. PARKS: That is a part of the State permit right there. We have to demonstrate -- we have to analyze all the hydraulics associated with the project, and we're working on it right now, as a matter of fact. And that's something that we submit to the State. The State -- all this activity that we're talking about has to go through the State permitting process. They're going to look at not only the water we're generating in the process but the storm water and how the storm water will be

1 affected by the change in the hydraulics, they will look at that.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

Bill, do you want to add anything? MR. KELLEY: We can divert some water back to the lake. We can give them some back. We have a Fish and Wildlife management proposal, certainly.

MS. TREY CARTER: I'm Trey Carter and I live over in Quail Hollow. You say that as far as the dust issue -- you guys are going to be responsible -are you going to be responsible for that also?

MR. WILLIFORD: Yes.

MS. CARTER: My son has severe allergy and asthma. He has to have two or three medications a day plus he does weekly shots just to keep it under If you bring a gravel pit in -- I've already talked to two specialists -- he's going to undergo some serious problems.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE SPEAKER: I've got a letter from my doctor right here -- my daughter just was released from the hospital -- saying --

MS. CARTER: (Interposing) This is a health issue. We're talking about my son's life.

MR. WILLIFORD: Okay. We're talking about issues that Alan and I are both concerned with.

lives within a half of mile of our competitor's 1 2 gravel operation -- I do, he lives within a quarter of a mile of it. Our families are raised there and we have no issues with these problems because they're responsible producers just like we are.

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE SPEAKER: But when our children get sick, you're responsible, right?

MS. CARTER: Do your children have severe allergy and asthma problems? I mean it may not affect you but you don't already have children with that condition.

MR. WILLIFORD: We're operating seven of these facilities right now and this is not an issue at any of the locations. The only time that we've had dust problems is when we're constructing the property. We have a water truck there while we're building, in progress, to control that, to minimize that, as much as possible.

And, you know, we would be glad for you-all to take a tour of some of our other operations or talk to some of the other governments where we do business. The Memphis City Health Department is very familiar with our operation. We do quite a bit down in Desoto County.

2.1

We are also controlled by MSHA, which is
Mine Safe and Health Administration which is the same
one that monitors all of our locations. Any mining
activity within the United States, and they come in
twice a year, and put dust monitors on our employees
because we're concerned that our employees are being
affected just like anybody else. We have to pass
certain standards or we have to state some kind of
engineering control to make sure where a situation
like this is concerned. The Mine Safety and Health
Administration, they won't tolerate for employees, so
you know it's definitely not affecting somebody
that's a quarter of a mile or a third of a mile away
or whatever.

MS. CARTER: Like you said with your employees, they're in physical condition to handle that kind of thing but my son, my child, and I know Dottie's child, they are very sensitive to that kind of thing. There are days they can't go outside and play because it's too dry and the dust is blowing. And I know that that's not anything that we can prevent but something like this, you know, I'm just - you're asking to put my son at risk.

MR. WILLIFORD: First of all, I don't think

you're exposed as much because of the engineering controls that we have put in. By moving the majority of the material by conveyor, like Alan pointed out, the material is wet and it's put into a hopper and then loaded on the conveyor and it's going to the wash basin.

We're pulling seven thousand gallons per minute of water. I mean so we're -- what we're doing is we're taking the clay out of the material and it goes back into these ponds.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE SPEAKER: We're talking over a period of time our children are going to be breathing so much of this stuff that over a period of time it will add up.

MR. HARRY HADDAD: Harry Haddad, I live in Rosemark Estates and I'm hearing you say a quarter to a half of mile as an example. How many houses are going to be within 300 feet? I think I read 300 feet as the buffer zone, between the back of the house. Did I read that?

MR. PARKS: That's correct.

MR. HADDAD: I mean I appreciate your examples but those are not good examples in this

situation. I don't know about Quail Hollow, there are some much closer than that. I know the whole Santa Rose Drive in Rosemark Estates -- I've seen the plans for Phase II -- and they're all within 300 feet.

This is over the hill by the edge of my fence. I'd like to point that out. So when you give us examples, please, understand that's not

MR. WILLIFORD: That's a very good point. The situation that's behind your house is that, you know, you guys are going to know it's there when we're constructing the berm. After that, with the new sound system that we've got with the back-up alarms, I really don't think that you'll know we're there. And that's the purpose for us buying this tract of land here. There's very little gravel on this property -- is because we wanted to get the plant -- because the plant is where most of the noise is generated -- we wanted to get it as far away from you guys as possible.

MR. AUSTIN: What happens at that plant? What do you do at that plant?

MR. WILLIFORD: That's where I'm talking about that the material is washed and processed.

There's two sets of screens, and they're made out of rubber. The reason because we make them out of rubber instead of steel is because they last longer and they're quieter. When that material hits it there are spray bars of water that come down on it with a lot of force and it separates the rock from the sand, the first set of screens.

MR. AUSTIN: Are the (inaudible) loaded onto to trucks?

MR. WILLIFORD: Yes, sir.

MR. AUSTIN: Okay. And it travels south to the access road?

MR. WILLIFORD: Yes, sir.

MR. AUSTIN: And the access is a quarter of a mile from Miller Road?

MR. WILLIFORD: Sir?

MR. AUSTIN: The access is a quarter or a half of mile?

MR. WILLIFORD: Yes, sir.

MR. AUSTIN: At a hundred and ten degrees your truck ain't going to keep with it the dust.

MR. WILLIFORD: Sir, if that's the case I'll pave that road before I let the dust come off that road.

MR. JOHNSON: Next question.

l

MR. JACK TICKLE: I'm Jack Tickle. I'm concerned about the Crum property. Some thirty years ago Jessie Harris owned that property. He asked for a permit to mine that gravel. Some thirty years ago it was denied him. I bought the property myself. I didn't buy it for the purpose of mining. I bought it for the purpose of subdividing it. I ended up selling it to Mr. Crum. I'm not crying about anything but I wanted to build up everywhere. I even tried to buy the Smith's property.

But, I'm trying to say, what has happened in the last thirty years that warrants it being a gravel pit today when it wasn't worth being a gravel pit, to the County, thirty years ago?

MR. HADDAD: And there weren't any houses right there thirty years ago either.

MR. AUSTIN: You've three million dollars worth of houses down there in that subdivision.

MR. TICKLE: That's right, probably more than three million.

MR. PERRY ETTEHAD: I have more to lose than anybody sitting in this room. I owe 170 acres on the north side of the Smith property. I have two

lakes, one of them is fifteen acres, the other one is five acres.

I've spent all day -- I'm a Civil Engineer- surveying the lines. I'm getting eighty-five acres
of run-off. There are four pipes that goes under
Tracy Road. Every one of them is forty-two inches in
diameter and they're going to come to my property.

I've been getting that. One of them is close to Mr.
Rogers, the next one is -- I'm getting all of that,
as I said eighty-five acres of rainfall coming to my
property. Once you combine with that, this area,
which is right in front of Mr. Rogers, you have
seventy-two acres. The only thing you got left over
here on the Smith property is a bunch of gullies and
ditches and no good land, which that's the reason you
don't mine over there.

You're going to destroy over here. I've been offered -- let me tell you, you looking for trouble. I been offered two and half million dollars for my property. Once you put this darn thing over there, I won't have that, and I'm upset. I'm losing what I've got. I've worked all my life, that's the only savings I got, and you're coming over here and the sweet talk you're going to be a good neighbor.

All right. If you're a good neighbor, get the hell out of here.

(Audience applause)

MR. WILLIFORD: Can I address property values?

MR. JOHNSON: Yes, sir.

MR. WILLIFORD: We've operated, like I said, in many locations all through North Mississippi and over in Memphis and Shelby County, and we are currently operating on a place down on Green Pea Road down in North Mississippi, down in Desoto County.

The property, we actually purchased it, and we've got a planned unit development that they're trying to sell to a developer now. There have been subdivisions that have been built all around it.

It's like the subdivisions that are being built all around Standard Construction in Collierville,

Tennessee.

We've had studies done with real estate agents on our property down there in Desoto County and also one of our competitors out in Collierville, and there's not been any lost value, property value, due to the gravel operation.

MR. ETTEHAD: You're wrong about that,

absolutely wrong.

MR. AUSTIN: There's a man on Miller Road that lost \$250,000 because you guys showed up.

MR. JOHNSON: Mr. Tickle?

MR. TICKLE: I asked why it was warranted now and it didn't warrant it in 1976, when you denied Mr. Jessie Harris. I think everybody probably knows him.

MR. ETTEHAD: Yes, sir. He dedicated land to Methodist North.

MR. TICKLE: Right.

MR. WILLIFORD: Mr. Tickle, I was not aware of that or we would have been out there a long time ago, if we'd known --

MR. ETTEHAD: (Interposing) That don't impress me. That don't impress me, sir. You're just here to enhance your pocket. I got more news. I have a hundred and seventy acres. I've got two contract offers, two and a half million dollars. Do you think people going to come out here next to a gravel pit anymore? No.

MR. WILLIAM HALL: That's my question.

What do you think our property value is right now with this on the internet. Do you think someone is

even going to -- if I put my house on the market today, I couldn't give it away.

MR. HASKINS: Same here. If we had to move, if I got transferred on my job and I had to move next week, or next month, there's no way I could get fair market value. Maybe in ten years, but I may not be there for ten years.

MS. WESTERMAN: I'm sorry, that's not true. In the real estate market it's based on square footage.

MR. HASKINS: I'm Mike Haskins. I live in Quail Hollow. I'm going to take more than three minutes.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: He can have my three minutes.

MR. HASKINS: And the first thing, is when are you-all going to vote on this?

MR. JOHNSON: Tonight.

MR. HASKINS: Tonight. You're going to vote tonight? That's not fair. That's not fair and I've been through these things before with the business that I work for in Millington, and we were given ample opportunity to review the full set of engineering drawings, to look at the landfill that

was going in next to our plant, have our professional engineer look it, review it, comment, and work towards something -- if we can't make this go away -- at least work toward something that we know, that we have been told by a professional engineer that's working for us, looking out for our interest, that it's a proper design.

Because, guys -- Mr. Bobby, I know you, I don't want to offend either one of your guys -- but you-all don't know anything about a gravel mine operation.

MR. ETTEHAD: Exactly.

MR. HASKINS: You-all give me my time now.

I'm an engineer like Mr. Perry. And most people -you guys don't -- who's setting the regulations and
the conditions for their operation, how big the berms
have to be, what's the set-back, how high. You know,
I've educated myself because I have one of the guys - we'll get to that in a minute.

But there's no way that I can sit down and get everything answered that I have on my mind about how this is going to affect us tonight, in this little span of time. We just found out this on the web site for us to review this weekend. That's it.

I've been working ten or twelve hours a day at the plant trying to get some other things straightened out and it's not adequate time. It's, you know, it's very inappropriate that this gets shoved at us this quick with only a chance to look at it.

I mean look at Quail Hollow guys, there's not either one of you-all or any rational, logical human being that would walk in here and look at that and say, oh, that's okay. We're going to surround you with a gravel mine. It's mind boggling that we have to sit and discuss this.

We've put our hearts and souls and everything we've got to move out here to lovely, beautiful Tipton County, in the country, nice, peaceful, I'm looking at cows and barns and I love it, and now I'm going to be on my deck looking four hundred feet away, while I'm swimming in the pool and cooking out with the kids, at a gravel mine. And all we've heard is we don't think it'll impact you because we've got new back-up alarms. We don't think you'll see anything. We don't think you'll hear anything. We don't think there'll be dust.

MR. HALL: If you vote tonight we don't even have time to do research on our side. I mean if

I go to the doctor's office and he tells me I've got cancer I, at least, have time to get a second opinion.

(Audience applause)

MR. JOHNSON: Yes, sir.

MR. HASKINS: I've got a letter to present also. We really need assurance that we won't have a negative impact on noise level, the view, what we see from our back door, the lifestyle, the value of our homes. I mean this is everything I've got, this house. And I'm telling you, it's mind-boggling that we have to even think about this. I can't imagine that everybody thinks it's okay to put a gravel mine around Quail Hollow Cove and wrap it on three of the four sides, and pump it right up the butt of Rosemark Estates. It doesn't make sense.

MR. HALL: And it doesn't affect our property value.

MR. HASKINS: And it doesn't affect our property value, no impact. I went ahead and hired an engineering firm, to start looking at this stuff, that's been involved in designing gravel mines and doing things and I'm sure Mr. Williford knows Mr. Ed Williams. He's been doing it about forty years. And

I let Mr. Ed look at one of these drawings and comment. This is what he had to say. He's been working for several of us homeowners. And he is a well known ex-county commissioner from Shelby County, and has been doing environmental engineering for at least thirty-five years. He has designed gravel mining operations.

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

He has said he has concerns with what he's seen about the berms and has given some guidelines like the height of the berms. The height of the berm should be so that you don't see any -- should be higher than the highest house, the highest roof line. And, for instance, this berm around Quail Hollow Lake probably needs to come south and extend all the way down to protect that lake more. These berms should be built, in our opinion, these berms should be built before anything else happens so that we don't see and hear (inaudible). They should be built and properly seeded so that within thirty days there's no run-off. They should be the proper size. We should be able to look at the cross section, the height, the setback, and understand. We should have an independent engineer, that's a licensed professional, and ethical, to help us understand what we're up against.

We deserve that chance.

MR. ETTEHAD: We deserve that.

MR. HALL: We're not asking the City of Atoka to do anything.

MR. JOHNSON: Yes, sir.

MR. RANDY CLARK: I'm Randy Clark. I live in Rosemark Estates right in the middle of -- Santa Rose. My understanding is that there will be a road going right along the property boundary, a service road. We've got fifteen or twenty feet for a service road and then we've got a berm going up.

MR. PARK: We're not going to have a service road along this side. There's going to be a berm.

MR. CLARK: Where does the berm start, how many feet off of the property line?

MR. PARK: The excavation will be at least a hundred feet from the property line and then it will be between that and -- we don't want to destroy any vegetation that's already there unnecessarily. We're going utilize existing vegetation where we can. There won't be any traffic there. And this may be adjusted once we actually go out there. If we can save a tree, you know.

MR. CLARK: If it's a problem with dust or sound will you-all come back and raise the berm?
What's it going to be, eight to ten feet?

 $$\operatorname{MR.}$$ WILLIFORD: Eight to twelve feet will be the berm.

MR. PARK: And it's dependent upon topography. It may be higher at some places because we have to fill, you know.

MR. CLARK: But if it's not quite high enough would you-all come back at a later date and raise it higher?

MR. PARK: Sure. I mean we'll do whatever we have to do to make it effective.

MR. HASKINS: All these conditions, if this is going to go forward, all these conditions have to be set out by the City of Atoka so there is some regulation of this operation. I mean right now, if you-all vote this in, they'll be able to run roughshod over us and do whatever they want to do.

They may be ethical folks. I don't know. I haven't had a chance to really get into all that, to even consider it. This is happening -- all this information came at us quickly.

MR. JOHNSON: Ms. Cotton is next.

MS. MARILYN COTTON: My name is Marilyn Cotton. I'm your neighbor on the west where the trees are and I figure this is already — this is going to happen. (Inaudible) But I'm worried about Miller down here. I use that road to go to Shelby County, and that's not a good road. If you're going to have trucks on it, if I meet one of those trucks I'm going to be dead. Are they going to improve that road? Let me ask my questions. I'd like to know what height of trees you're putting right against my property.

MR. WILLIFORD: Ma'am, we have already met with the Shelby County Road Department on two occasions and we've not finalized it because we're still checking into the right-of-way, but we do plan on widening that section of Miller Road going to Mudville because, you're right, it's not wide enough at this time. And we will be responsible for that road, so if the trucks that are coming in and out of the operation tear up the road we will repair it.

And the trees that are going -- I haven't discussed it but there will probably be, more than likely, one or two choices which would be some type of pine tree or Leland Cyprus.

4

5

6

7 8

9 10 11

12 13

14

15

16

17

18

19 20

21

22

23 24

MR. AUSTIN: Are they going to widen -you're paying to widen that road all the way down to Mudville?

MR. WILLIFORD: Yes, sir.

MR. KATHY NIX: My name is Kathy Nix. live on Tracy Road and my question is concerning the environmental issue.

I currently work at a chemical plant and I'm very aware of how things happen in the night, all sorts of times of day, and we have taken great pains to make sure that we don't have run-off of any sort. I want to know what your guarantees are of how you're going to monitor those things because when you're dealing with water you don't know until after the fact (inaudible).

So, I would like to know what your plans are on that. Do you have sluice gates or how are you going to monitor that and who rings the bell when it does happen?

MR. PARKS: All of our water has to be managed through an (inaudible). It's a big acronym, but the State is the regulatory agency that we have to report to. And all the water that impacts our operations, we capture either in our process basins -

- because water is a valuable commodity for us.

We're going to recycle all that we can. When we have more than we need, we treat it and we meet a standard that's set by the State that insures that the water that we're going to discharge into this creek is not inconsistent with the receiving water, and so it's got to be at least as good and normally it's better than what's in the existing creeks in this area.

We'll install temporary storm water structures where we need to. When we go into an area and we have our initial disturbance, we'll construct a temporary basin to capture the water so we can treat it before we discharge it. As we're mining we're creating space to manage it, so we'll divert that water into our areas that we're mining out and that eventually ends up as a reclaimed lake. And so the reclaimed lake is compensating for the material that we're not putting back.

We are going to have to remove a certain amount of overburden to get to the gravel. And as we're mining we're going to take that overburden -- we don't just start on one side and open up this whole thing. It's laid off in small increments, and as we mine this area out we'll take the overburden

from that and start banking it. And as we end up we're going to, you know, we reach that balance where we don't have any more dirt and that's how we compensate.

MS. NIX: Well, I mean I know how regulated we are at our facility because it's a chemical plant but I know that at the same time that the volatility of what we have, I mean we still don't have people show up on a regular basis. The only time we have somebody show up is if there's a problem, and that's my concern, you know, you really aren't going to be regulated.

MR. PARK: The Tennessee Department of Conservation, they show up at our operations a lot more.

MS. NIX: They do?

MR. PARK: Yes. We have a very good working relationship with the regulators and they have an office in Jackson, their field office is in Jackson. There's also a local office in Memphis and we've already made contact with the agency and we have to first identify all of the steams. They do routine inspections and they also do unannounced inspections, and then they do inspections where

5

4

6 7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14 15

16

17

18 19

20

21

22

23

ground water well.

24

there's a reported problem. They have to inspect -anytime that there's a complaint, that triggers an inspection.

And it's in our interest to control the run-off. We're not going to be -- when we discharge it it's under a permit situation. Otherwise, we're not allowed to discharge it.

MR. AUSTIN: You say you treated the water before it leaves. What are you treating out of it?

MR. PARKS: The clay that we're washing out of the sand and gravel.

MR. AUSTIN: Which is going to end up in Ouail Hollow Lake.

MR. PARKS: No, it's going to end up in these basins. We're purposely taking that sediment out of the sand and gravel, about seven or eight percent. Those are materials that we're not going to be able to use and so we return that back into these basins.

MR. AUSTIN: Where do you get the water from? It's not all rainwater. Are you drilling? MR. PARKS: We have to first install a

MR. AUSTIN: How deep are you going?

MR. PARKS: Typically it's down three or four hundred. It's in the large alluvial aquifer.

MR. AUSTIN: There are people here tonight that are concerned, Randy has got a well. There are several people in the area right around Quail Hollow that have wells.

MR. PARKS: Well, we have to, as far as our State permit process, we have to identify all public water wells whether they be used for drinking water or irrigation water, we have to identify those.

MR. AUSTIN: Private wells.

MR. PARKS: Private wells, and that's something the State reviews. I mean they're going to look at the water wells and make a decision on how our operation is going to affect it.

Now, historically speaking, we've never encountered any problems with groundwater wells that are near our operations, and we've been in business since -- we've been doing this for a long, long time. In Shelby County -- well, we've been in business since 1910. I mean we've mined a lot of area in the north Shelby County area and there's a local agency there, the Shelby County Health Department, they've monitored the groundwater. And, based on our

historical evidence, we've not had any impact as a result of our mining operations.

MR. KEITH NORMAN: I'm Keith Norman. I live in Quail Hollow also.

I agree with Mike. I don't think this is going to happen. I think our friends are going to watch out for us and not let them destroy everything we've worked for.

I'm glad to the noise is going to so minimal that we're not even going to know you're there. That's pretty amazing.

But the two ladies with the children with the health problems, the asthma problems, you-all never answered that. I believe you said that you had seven locations where this is not an issue. What they asked you is if this affects their children's health are you going to be responsible, are you going to step up and say we're the cause of their health problems deteriorating. Are you going to be responsible if it's proven that this affects their health?

MR. WILLIFORD: Well, sir, I mean there's always the issue, I guess, if we did anything to cause anybody any type of adverse reaction, there's

always the court system.

1

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

2 Now, I can sit up here and tell you all day 3 long that I'm not going to affect their asthma 4 I'm not a doctor. All I can tell you is we've never had this issue and we've been in Memphis since 1910, and we're operating four facilities in Desoto County and you guys know how fast Desoto County is growing. With the flight out of Memphis, we've got homes being built all around us just like yours. They've built right up next to our mined areas and this has not been an issue, and that's all I can tell you.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE SPEAKER: Do they know that those mines are there?

MR. WILLIFORD: Yes, ma'am.

MR. SHEPHERD: My name is David Shepherd. I live in the house right around the corner, 3637 Tracy Road. I have a lot right there around where it's going to be mined.

I can see all of the areas that are going to be mined from my house. A ten foot berm is not going to cover it where I can see it.

MR. HASKINS: It should be higher than your roof line.

MR. SHEPHERD: All the areas down in the bottoms, down both bottoms and up on top, I can see all that from my house. Ten foot is not going to cover it up.

MR. WILLIFORD: This matter will be mined with an excavation. Like Mr. Park said, we've got to take off twenty to twenty-five feet of dirt, I mean I call it dirt and he calls it overburden. But we will use this to build the berms, and we have to actually keep the topsoil separate from the rest of the material so we vegetate everything back.

Now, a lot of that topsoil will be used to build these berms that are eight to twelve foot high. Now, once we're down twenty-five feet then we'll start to mine the gravel, but that's when the excavator is in there. So not only will you have an eight to twelve foot berm but you're down twenty-five feet. So we've got an excavator down there and we've got a front end loader and it will be put onto to hopper and a conveyor up to the main facility.

MR. SHEPHERD: Where that conveyor is running over there, I mean I can see that all. I mean I'll have to see that every day.

MR. WILLIFORD: We'll do whatever we can to

minimize visibility and, you know, the impact. I mean if there is -- we can plant trees and everything like that.

MR. PARKS: Everything from your house, I mean you're up high and it kind of slopes back.

Ideally, where we build these berms, it's going to be up on a higher area.

MR. SHEPHERD: (Inaudible) it's a right straight ridge that goes right through there all the way back to the Van Cleve Farm.

MR. JOHNSON: Yes?

MR. PHIL SMITH: My name is Phil Smith. I own this property south of this on Miller Road in Shelby County, and my property backs up to Van Cleve's place. You-all talking about you're going to widen the road, I've got some real nice trees. I've got a little lake out front and a fountain. What about that? Are you going to knock all my trees down, put an interstate down through there and run gravel trucks up and down through there? I can't give it away. And we don't have any city water out there. It ends a quarter of a mile down the street. Can you-all run me water to ensure me that I won't be drinking mud? I've got a little creek out back, a

little branch creek. It's going to be right there where all that runs off into it. All those trees you see south, ain't but twenty of it mine but, you know, what about that?

MR. HASKINS: Are you the man that owns the pond?

MR. SMITH: Yeah.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: He lost a quarter of a million dollars because he had a buyer for his property and they found you were coming in and they backed out.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: I can't give it away. They back out.

MR. ALEX JOHNSON: My name is Alex Johnson and there's two things. First of all, in my opinion, I think this is trying to get ramrodded through.

MR. HASKINS: Yes.

MR. JOHNSON: Second of all, we should have a six month delay because we've got an engineering firm that's going to look at this. And thirdly, Mark, everybody here doesn't want it. You work for us. We're going to be miserable. This man lost a quarter of a million dollars. I don't know how you can vote for it. We came here -- I mean this is we

just showed up and, boom, it looks like ramrod day.

MR. ETTEHAD: Mr. Johnson, I don't represent the City of Atoka, but this is the mayor, this is the city alderman. You're destroying the most desirable piece of property. There are about eight hundred acres of land. That is the closest place to Shelby County. I've been offered -- some of the biggest developers banging my door and coming to me because it's desirable. People want to get out of Memphis. Where do they want to go? They want to be also close to their job, and that puts them close to their job, and it's all together about a thousand acres. And you're going to turn that into the least desirable area which should be the best of your property.

If you guys are looking for growth, that is where the growth will be. Once people have to drive eighty miles, ninety miles both ways they don't come, they don't commute. This is about twenty-eight minutes, and you're just -- you're not gaining, you're losing. A gravel pit is associated with darn no good area. We have a nice town. One of the best little towns across Shelby County, and this is the closest place to Shelby County.

If they want a gravel pit, let them go fifty, sixty, forty miles away from here. Don't destroy residential for just the sake of -- what do you-all gain? Nothing. What do you lose, a thousand houses.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Tax dollars.

MR. HADDAD: Harry Haddad again. Alan, who determines the set-backs, your company?

MR. PARKS: No. That's typically either the local agency or the State.

MR. HADDAD: Well, what about the setbacks? Did you just put those in there?

MR. PARKS: That was based on historically what is allowed.

MR. HADDAD: Okay.

MR. PARKS: And so we start with what is customary at our other operations.

 $$\operatorname{MR}.$$ HADDAD: Okay. And I see in Phase II, or is that Phase III?

MR. PARKS: This is --

MR. HADDAD: (Interposing) Forgive me.

The right corner. Just leave that up. Let me

address this. This Phase, the set-back is the

closest. Quail Hollow is surrounded. That's

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

terrible, and this is set back -- this is literally my back yard.

MR. ETTEHAD: And he's got a million dollar house, a million dollar house.

MR. HADDAD: It's not just me. It's just moving up right to the fence. Who establishes that, the State, the Commission here?

MR. PARKS: In some cases it's the local agency, the State typically requires, at a minimum, three hundred feet.

MR. HADDAD: I don't know how many houses are there, including Tommy's around the corner and then across the street. I mean it's just terribly close. I know what you've said, there's been no study, there's been a lot of numbers thrown out.

MR. PARKS: It's three hundred feet from a residential, an occupied residential dwelling, or a hundred feet from the property boundary.

MR. AUSTIN: If I move into my shed will you move another three hundred feet over?

MS. CARTER: I'm sorry, I'm not trying to beat a dead horse but we keep talking about health, and I'm not a confrontational person, but we're talking about my son's life here. And I'm hearing

you saying it's never happened, it's never happened, it's never happened. My doctor says it will happen if you do this, so how are you going to address that? You can have my house. Do you want to buy my house? Buy my house now, but I'm not going to live there and you put a gravel pit in and harm my twelve year old child. I'm not going to do it.

MR. GARY SMITH: I'm Gary Smith on Bethel Road and I just can't believe that something of this magnitude and you-all going to settle it with one meeting. All of the business you-all carry on up here, you hardly ever do anything and settle it one meeting, and you're going to have something of this magnitude and you're going to settle it with one meeting? It's just unheard of.

MR. ETTEHAD: That's a shame.

MR. SMITH: It's a ramrod job if you do that.

(Audience applause)

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE SPEAKER: I'm curious about the drilling and we all know earth shifts, earth moves. After a period of time, the drilling and everything that's going on, will it not damage foundations, put cracks in our slabs, make our homes

shift?

MR. PARKS: Everything that we've mined in Shelby County, with the exception of where we're mining right now, which is on Millington-Arlington Road, has been developed on. North of Highway 64 right where the Wolfchase area is, all that was mined out years ago, back in the '60's. South of the airport, between the airport and Stateline Road, all that was mined back in the '50's or '60's. We've mined areas around Sanga Road and Walnut Grove.

My point is, these areas are being redeveloped as time goes on.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: And most of it is warehouse.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Redeveloped. There was nothing developed there then.

MR. PARKS: Well, not warehouses. Like in the case of Collierville, there's a lot of residential areas that were built on formerly mined property.

MR. WILLIFORD: And I think she was concerned of the foundation of their houses now and, you know, some of the issues that you've read about in the paper was the limestone quarry where they're

blasting. We never blast. We never blast.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE SPEAKER: I haven't read anything in the paper. I just know that you-all are going to be drilling.

MR. WILLIFORD: And the drilling that we've done, I mean the only drilling that we do is we put an eight inch auger down in the ground, basically like putting a well in, to find the gravel and that's already been done on the properties. The other digging is using a backhoe that's out there and that's just removing the material a bucket at a time. It's not vibrations and that's not an issue.

MS. ESTHER SAUERS: My name is Esther
Sauers and I live in Quail Hollow. My concern is
that all of the examples that you-all keep giving,
areas, of what happens with the area after it's
mined. These are all existing houses and existing
areas. That's what I think everybody here is
concerned about, is the --

(Interrupted by audience applause)

MR. WILLIFORD: The examples I gave down in Desoto County and in Shelby County are current mines. Houses are being built around them, houses have been there for a number of years. So, no, ma'am, it is

not -- it is the same comparison.

MR. AUSTIN: The houses that are being built while you're mining are being sold after you're gone.

MR. WILLIFORD: No, sir, they're being sold while --

MR. AUSTIN: (Interposing) While you're working?

 $$\operatorname{MR.}$$ WILLIFORD: Because we've been there for twenty plus years.

MR. HADDAD: But they have a choice.

 $$\operatorname{MR.}$$ WILLIFORD: There were other properties that were there before, and during and after.

MR. BRUCE GURLEY: My name is Bruce Gurley and I live in Quail Hollow. And, as we've pointed out, we're encircled. What kind of boundaries, fences, barriers, are going to keep our kids from being curious and going exploring and getting caught up in your conveyors and getting drowned in your basis. I grew up in Indiana. All my swimming holes were old gravel pits. The lure is there for boys.

MR. HALL: And our kids play all back in there.

MR. GURLEY: No matter what you tell them,

they're going to go do what they want to and explore.

MR. HALL: There are trails all through those woods.

MR. GURLEY: What's to keep them from going? How are you going to keep them out so that a tragedy doesn't happen?

MR. HALL: Are you going to fence off your property?

MR. GURLEY: Is there going to be a fence or are you just going to have trees?

MR. WILLIFORD: There is currently fencing up because there's been cows and stuff like that. As far as the ponds, I mean there's a large pond in youall's subdivision.

 $$\operatorname{MR}.$$ AUSTIN: I'm not worried about the water as much as the conveyors.

MS. CARTER: We're worried about the ones who don't know they're there, the new homes that are coming, equipment, conveyors.

MR. JIMMY WHITEHEAD: I understand about a month ago, without our knowledge or anything, we just found out Atoka went ahead and annexed us into the city. They said this was for the purpose so they could have some control over this here. If they want

1 I

to have some control over it, they need to listen to the people tonight.

MS. CARTER: Exactly. The people that live in the town.

MR. WHITEHEAD: Bethel Road already is dangerous to a certain extent. Bethel Road, where Bethel Road ends at the Tipton County and Shelby County line, Miller Road takes up. It's going to make that road even that much more dangerous.

MR. AUSTIN: In fact, it was stated in the Covington Leader by our mayor that the trucks were going to go down and enter on Mudville Road and go to Highway 14.

MR. FOSTER: I'm Steve Foster. I also live on Bethel Road and I was at the meeting when we heard the promises that we would have more police on that road to slow down the traffic and the road would be taken care of and we found out the annexation turns around and doesn't even annex the road. So, really, we were kind of took on the last one, too.

MR. AUSTIN: Well, we've got a lot of cops coming down our dead end street telling kids they can't play basketball in the street.

MS. BETTY PERKINS: My name is Betty

Perkins and I live on Bethel Road. You said you had an operation on Millington-Arlington Road. How long has it been there, first of all? Shouldn't there be somebody here at this meeting who lives around that area that can tell us what's been going on?

MR. ACCIDENT: There are no activities, though. Everything has stopped out there.

MS. NIX: I drive by it everyday. There's nothing there.

MR. AUSTIN: There's a lawsuit in Byhalia.

MS. COTTON: What are going to be the hours of operation and do you know what the property, what's supposed to be done with it after you're done, what it's going to be developed to?

MR. WILLIFORD: We operate just one shift and we're typically Monday through Saturday. We operate daylight hours. We will not be running at night. There will not be three shifts around the clock.

What's going to happen with the property afterwards, like I said, the property that we own, we've never developed our properties that we've mined on before. We've got one now that the family owns our company has a planned community development on it

with commercial and residential housing. It's in Desoto County and they are probably going to sell it a developer. Now, that's just our tract.

The Smith and the Crum property, the Crum property, I don't want to speak for them but they're planning on building a house right here. In fact, there's gravel right there and they wanted it left out because they wanted to have a house that oversees that twenty acre lake.

The Smith property, the Smiths are here.

They don't know what they're going to do with the property. They said the kids will have it and they'll probably, you know, decide what to do with it a number of years later.

You know, once we get through mining the property it's usually about seven years before they can build on it. You know, I mean we put it back into pasture land and stuff like that. It is useful. They can, you know, put cows or whatever back on it.

MR. AUSTIN: So those existing ponds will stay there, the ponds, at the end of the excavation?

MR. WILLIFORD: Yes, sir. Those ponds will be there at the end of the excavation.

MR. ETTEHAD: What about the berms? Are

those berms going to stay over there or are you going to knock them down?

MR. WILLIFORD: No, sir. We would take those back down.

MR. TICKLE: All of this is ideal, prime residential property, and if it goes into a mining situation it'll be several years before it can be used for residential or anything else. So you're depriving people of living in a fine area. I know it's perfect. I know all about it. I'm in the real estate development business. I developed Rosemark Estates. I would have already developed that property.

MR. ETTEHAD: I just can't see why you-all are doing this.

MR. TICKLE: Residential property should not be put into a mining situation and deprive people of it until they get through mining. You're talking about ten years from now.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Twenty-seven years.

MR. ETTEHAD: I just can't believe what you-all are doing. It don't make economic business sense. You're destroying the most desirable piece of

property that you've got. They need to get out of Memphis but they want to be close to their job.

That's where they're going to.

MS. COX: If I understand right, you still have some negotiations here as far as things that you --

MR. AUSTIN: (Interposing) They can tell them no. They can tell them no and we're done.

MR. HASKINS: We don't want it.

(Whereupon numerous individuals spoke simultaneously)

MS. COX: I was recognized. If that's the case, since you have your sister company Lehman Roberts, who does paving, could you negotiate something for that hill?

(Whereupon numerous individuals spoke simultaneously)

MS. COX: Good manners, I would appreciate that. Could you possibly negotiate something with them because there's going to be increased traffic, probably from your own employees, because it's going to be easy access for them to go over to Atoka for their meals and that kind of thing? At least that would reduce some of the danger, maybe give something back to the community.

MS. CARTER: I just want to say one thing

and then I'm going to stop. To me this sounds like an issue of making a buck and ruining a lot of people's lives and just please take that into consideration when you vote.

MR. NICHOLS: How long has the City of
Atoka known this? I'm Jeff Nichols from Quail
Hollow. They seemed to have already bought a piece
of land and no one had a clue. I bought a house in
November in Quail Hollow and no one told me that that
stuff was going to happen. I didn't find out until
probably three weeks ago when Mr. Perry over here
came to my house. So how long have you known this?

MR. HASKINS: Since these guys came to them and said will you work with us if we buy this land and try to do this. It's like Mr. Walker said in the paper, they wouldn't spend a million dollars unless they had plans.

MR. ETTEHAD: This man owns a million dollar house, and you touch eleven houses with three hundred, twenty-two houses within six hundred. The project is only two hundred feet from Blades. If you take a thousand foot radius you're going to occupy another fifty, sixty houses in Blades, just to call Atoka gravel so-and-so. It just don't add up.

MR. JOHNSON: About two months.

MR. NICHOLS: How long have you owned that, sir? How long have you owned it?

 $$\operatorname{MR.}$$ WILLIFORD: I'm trying to remember when we bought it.

MR. AUSTIN: And it's like it's already planned.

MR. WILLIFORD: I think we bought the property back last fall. And the reason we bought the property is because we through the distance away from the homeowners -- we paid a lot of money for this property --

 $$\operatorname{MR.}$ AUSTIN: (Interposing) I paid a lot of money for mine.

MR. WILLIFORD: (Continuing) -- to be away from the homeowners, and this where we thought the best access was. I mean we don't want to travel Tracy Road.

MR. NICHOLS: Well, that's very considerate, but if you bought that land then you already had a plan and pardon me for maybe speaking disrespectful but if you guys bought that then you guys had already been talking. I'm sorry, I had to be known.

MR. WILLIFORD: The property was for sale and we had drilled the Crum property, and when we found the gravel resource there they had an option to purchase the Van Cleave property. And we took that option and we bought the property. The City of Atoka had no idea.

MR. NICHOLS: It just seems to me like it was planned and we just found out about it as a group, you know. We had no clue about it but you guys had already bought it. I didn't see a darn thing in the paper.

MR. AUSTIN: They didn't want us to so they could make money.

MR. NICHOLS: And one other question, on that -- your first map up there, can you turn that first map over? That one, what is that buffer zone right there? That thousand feet, what is that?

MS. CARTER: On the other side of Tracy.

(Whereupon Mr. Shepherd provided a map)

MR. PARKS: This is a one thousand foot area that is away from our leased area, and that was required in the Atoka zoning ordinance.

MR. NICHOLS: What does it do?

MR. PARKS: It's just a notification of the

affected community within that thousand feet. We provided them with all of the names of the residents.

MR. HALL: Okay. That's the people that got the "Howdy Neighbor" cards.

MR. PARKS: Just as part of the permit, or part of the application process, we were provided this.

MR. NICHOLS: Why did they provide the people in Quail Hollow. We never got anything.

(Whereupon numerous individuals spoke simultaneously)

MR. NICHOLS: I guess if everything was on the up-and-up we would have gotten something saying we're thinking about doing this, not that we're planning on doing it but we're thinking about it.

(Whereupon numerous individuals spoke simultaneously)

MR. JOHNSON: So there were so many people talking we didn't understand your question.

MR. NICHOLS: Like I said, why were we no notified when all this first came to light? Instead of saying, hey, this is where we're going to put a gravel pit, instead say, hey, we're thinking about putting one, what do you-all think and get us here a month or two ahead of time.

MR. JOHNSON: We did have public notice.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9 10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

believe we had an article in the Covington Leader.

MR. NICHOLS: How big was the article? I heard it was like two by two or something.

MR. TOMMY ROGERS: I'm Tommy Rogers. I live on Tracy Road.

> (Whereupon, Chairman sounded gavel in an attempt to regain order)

MR. ROGERS: I think in the best interest it would be, in my opinion, to put this off a night until people have a little bit more information, not that I'm involved in it. I live in Tracy Road right across -- I am a Board member and I didn't find out about it until about three months ago. I don't think anybody on the Board knew it at that time.

MR. AUSTIN: When did they do the annexation?

MR. ROGERS: When we found out they were going to take it in, about three months, the first of the year or whenever, we decided to take it into the city so we could have some control over it if it becomes a gravel pit, so we could protect, you know, as much rights as we could. But we are, of course, limited, too.

MR. WHITEHEAD: Which is what I'm saying,

because we just got annexed.

MR. TICKLE: It's not going to be a gravel pit if you-all don't want it to be gravel pit. I want you to understand, it won't be a gravel pit unless you say you want to be a pit.

MR. ETTEHAD: There are five Board members, if three of them don't want it -- you live only fifty feet from it. You've got a half a million dollar house. I been walking through the Smith property all day today to evaluate the situation. It just doesn't make sense.

MR. HASKINS: I want to clarify something. You-all have full control over it because they cannot do anything on this property unless this Board votes to give them a variance to operate a mine on this property that's zoned FAR and that is the law. They have the full authority to meet with a proper environmental consultant that's working for the Town of Atoka, or working for us, and get the other side of the story before moving forward and that's what I request, and I know that Mr. Shinosky and Mr. Austin and Mr. Haskins and Mr. Haddad, we will pay the bill for you to sit down with a licensed professional engineer, Mr. Ed Williams, who is highly respected,

who has designed and consulted for Memphis Stone and Gravel, to let him look at the full engineering plans if this is up-and-up.

I don't know if Mr. Kelley works for these guys, or an engineering firm that's contracted but if this is on the up-and-up we would be provided the opportunity to have our engineer looking at all the drawings and comment so that something -- if this does have to go forward, at least we've got input.

That's only fair. We don't want it, you know, it's like the letter says, we can compromise all you want and we're going to fight it.

MR. WILLIFORD: Can I kind of answer his question? We will have to go before a State permit and you guys can request a hearing at that to address your concerns about the environmental issues, and this is a separate permit from what we're trying to achieve tonight. You can be heard at that time and I think all of your questions will be answered.

MR. HASKINS: No, sir, because these guys are the ones that can set the conditions. I have a multi-sector permit out and all they do is regulate what runs off your property and your storm water and all that. They don't regulate how you operate, what

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10 11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

you do, when you can operate, how tall your berm has got to be, none of that. They just look at your water quality and your run-off.

These guys -- don't try to pull that crap on us. These guys are the ones that can set the conditions and say we will give you the variance and here's how the Town of Atoka says you have to operate. We demand that.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: I came here five years ago with Bowater, the Bowater plant in Covington and I moved down here to get away from -and to be in the woods, and I own the last house right there. If you look where they're cutting them trees out, they're going to clear the whole back side of that lake and there's wildlife, deer and everything, that goes through there every morning when I'm going to work. There's no way that's not going to affect, along with the drainage -everybody down that road is sitting right here, everybody on that lake, sitting right in this room, because it will affect that lake.

MR. SHINOSKY: If you're going to take that overburden to build berms and you're saying you're not going to have a dust problem, you're mistaken.

If you start moving that overburden and building twelve foot high berms you're going to have a dust problem.

MR. HASKINS: You know, Mark, we're pretty serious. This engineering firm is coming out of concerned people's pocket. We can stop this. Just say no, we're done, have a nice day, everybody packs it up and we start smiling tomorrow. We don't have to have any more meetings.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: There's plenty of developers that would --

(Whereupon numerous individuals spoke simultaneously)

MR. JOHNSON: Do you want to comment?

MR. WILLIFORD: I was going to comment on the berm issue and I made the point earlier in my presentation that the only time that I think you guys might have a dust problem is during the construction of the berms. At that time we will have a water truck out there with the trucks that will be building the berms to minimize the dust as much as possible. As soon as we build the berms we seed them and get a stand of grass on those.

MR. TICKLE: Do you deny that this is prime residential?

 $\label{eq:MS.WESTERMAN:} \quad \text{Is OSHA involved in this at} \\ \text{all or EPA?}$

(Whereupon numerous individuals spoke simultaneously)

MR. NICHOLS: She asked if OSHA or EPA was involved in this.

(Whereupon the Chairman sounded gavel in at attempt to regain order)

MR. PARKS: The primary regulatory agency for environmental matters is the State of Tennessee. The EPA is a Federal agency and it can get involved at any point in time. They basically make sure the state is making sure that we're following the rules.

With regard to the permitting, this is going to more than a multi-sector permit. It's not going to be on a general permit. It's going to be under an individual (inaudible) project. Through the mining sector, they have a separate branch that regulates mining activity, because it's a little more than your typical, you know, residential construction which requires a general permit.

So, it will be scrutinized a little more than your typical subdivision or other land disturbance.

With regard to safety, that falls under --

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

mining has a separate agency, just like OSHA, they
have MSHA which all they look at is mining. They
look at things like safety with regard to equipment
being exposed, noise and -- I mean we don't want our
employees to be subjected to any more adverse
conditions than are necessary, because they have to
work right there with that.

2 I

MR. HASKINS: I still propose that MSHA is only concerned with the environment, health and safety of their employees. MSHA is only concerned about the health and safety of the employees of MSG and the Tennessee Department of Environmental Conservation is only concerned about the run-off. Nobody is going to be regulating this for the noise, the things that we have to deal with, what we see, what happens to us. We'll have a little bit of recourse with storm water, if there's mud and stuff that affects our property, but why should we have to?

MR. SHINOSKY: I don't know how this is supposed to be done but would somebody just make a motion that we just delay this for a hundred and eighty days so we can just start over and get this whole process -- or table this for a hundred and eighty days and just revisit it, you know, six months

from now?

3 ram

ramrod job.

MR. ETTEHAD: Only one member of the Planning Commission is here.

MR. JOHNSON: Okay. Tom is going to talk to you about our Ordinance. In FAR mining is allowed on appeal if there are conditions met. Those eight conditions that have to be met and he's going to talk to you about that.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: It looks like a

MR. TEAGUE: Okay. My name is Tom Teague.

I work for the State of Tennessee with the local

Planning Assistance Officer, which the Town of Atoka
has a contract with our agency to provide planning

assistance for the town, primarily to advise the

Planning Commission and, upon visitation, advice

regarding current local zoning ordinances that affect
this area.

The area is zoned FAR. Prior to annexation, the area was zoned FAR but this meeting would have been held before a Tipton County Board of General Appeal. The applicant is asking for a use which is permitted, but it has to be permitted on appeal, therefore, they have to come to this body.

If it was a permitted use by (inaudible) then that would not be an issue. They would be granted to use the land as they see fit under the zoning ordinance.

The Board of Zoning Appeals has to consider foremost the general health, safety, and welfare of the community, and they are charged with the responsibility of making sure that those conditions are met and that any encumbrance upon those conditions are mitigated through action by the Board of Zoning Appeals, put forth as a condition of that use.

A lot of issues have been raised here. All the issues are valid. Tennessee Code Annotates which governs the public hearing notice on this, it sound likes, from this audience's perspective, is a little bit inadequate but the law says that you have to post notice fifteen days in a newspaper of general population and that requirement, I assume, has been met.

MR. SHEPHERD: Which paper was it in?
MR. AUSTIN: The Covington Leader.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Last week? Was that last week's paper?

MR. TEAGUE: It would have had to have been

fifteen days prior to this.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: It's been more than fifteen days. I don't remember the exact date.

MR. TEAGUE: But I'm in agreement, I mean, you know, when I'm affected by things if I don't subscribe to that newspaper then I'm not notified of it. Probably the notice could be a little bit better but, unfortunately, that's what we have to work with right now.

To review the applicant, again, most of the issues address health and safety issues. A lot of those issues have been raised here tonight and it sounds to me like, you know, some of the issues have been adequately addressed and maybe some of them haven't been adequately addressed, depending on your perspective. I guess that could be the case with anything.

The suggestion was made earlier about a motion from the floor. That's not in order. All motions have to come from the Board of Zoning Appeals but it can certainly be taken under advisement. The decision doesn't have to be made tonight. The Board can request additional information. This is what is termed a quasi-judicial review. Any action taken by

this Board can be challenged by you, the public, or by the applicant in a Court of Law.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Well, how about the people that just don't want it. Is there any recourse to that? I mean the people that are really impacted are the people that live around it.

MR. TEAGUE: If the Board of Zoning Appeals decides in a matter unacceptable to anybody here, legal recourse is an option.

MR. SHEPHERD: In what court?

MR. TEAGUE: Chancery Court would be the first court of hearing, but they also have the same right.

MR. AUSTIN: The State -- or Tipton County procedure for authorizing special exemptions, Article 8.060, says review is requested by the Building Inspector's Office to determine whether a proposed use is potentially (inaudible), toxic, dangerous or offensive, or determined to be a public nuisance, which it is.

At B-7 it says the proposed use shall not generate noise or produce smoke, which we're not concerned with.

MR. TEAGUE: Excuse me. You're quoting

| 1 | from the Tipton County general resolutions? | | | | | | |
|----|---|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| 2 | MR. AUSTIN: They don't have jurisdiction | | | | | | |
| 3 | over this property anymore. It's been annexed by | | | | | | |
| 4 | Atoka. | | | | | | |
| 5 | (Whereupon numerous individuals spoke simultaneously) | | | | | | |
| 6 | MR. TEAGUE: I'm just saying that zoning | | | | | | |
| 7 | regulation doesn't apply to this location anymore. | | | | | | |
| 8 | MR. AUSTIN: Do we have one? | | | | | | |
| 9 | MR. TEAGUE: Yes. | | | | | | |
| 10 | (Whereupon numerous individuals spoke simultaneously) | | | | | | |
| 11 | MR. TEAGUE: We are changed with, fire and | | | | | | |
| 12 | foremost, protection of health, safety and general | | | | | | |
| 13 | welfare. | | | | | | |
| 14 | MR. HALL: And that includes our property | | | | | | |
| 15 | value, right? | | | | | | |
| 16 | MR. TEAGUE: It's an open-ended statement | | | | | | |
| 17 | meant to provide some flexibility. Economic | | | | | | |
| 18 | considerations have and have not been allowed in a | | | | | | |
| 19 | Court of Law. | | | | | | |
| 20 | MR. TICKLE: The mayor and aldermen have | | | | | | |
| 21 | the final say-so. | | | | | | |
| 22 | MR. TEAGUE: The mayor and aldermen, no, | | | | | | |
| 23 | sir. The Board. | | | | | | |
| 24 | MR. TICKLE: They have to recommend it, or | | | | | | |

not recommend it.

(Whereupon, numerous individuals spoke simultaneously)

MR. JOHNSON: Shu, shu, shu.

MR. TICKLE: You're saying the mayor and aldermen have to do whatever they say? Is that what you're saying?

MR. TEAGUE: They don't have any say about it. They don't chime-in on it.

MR. TICKLE: It's supposed to be recommended.

MR. TEAGUE: In some states that may be the case but in Tennessee the BEA has the final say and then it goes to a Court of Law.

MR. HASKINS: In Tennessee who has

MR. TEAGUE: In the State of Tennessee the Board of Zoning Appeals, as defined by the enabling legislation, Tennessee Code Annotated, which this body has the final say and any decision that they make would then be -- perhaps be litigated in a Court of Law.

MR. TICKLE: Then the right people are sitting right up there.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: If they say no,

it's over.

MR. TICKLE: You're talking to the right people. There's only two people on the board.

That's the right people sitting right up there. He just told you.

MR. JOHNSON: We've asked questions over the period of a couple of months since we've known about it and it's my understanding that as long as the conditions are met in our zoning ordinance, there's not a whole lot we can do.

MR. AUSTIN: Yes, you can turn it down.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE SPEAKER: Are you
getting a raise out of this?

MR. JOHNSON: They've went above and beyond what the Zoning Ordinance says and they've agreed to pave Quail Hollow, to work with the Smith family to straighten Rogers Corner, which is a safety issue, bring it up to current standards.

MR. WHITEHORN: In other words, this was set when we walked in the door. This was already made, what you-all were going to do, you just didn't let us know.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE SPEAKER: This was a formality.

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

stipulated.

biggest --

MR. AUSTIN: It sounds to me like this was rubber-stamped before this meeting ever started.

MR. TEAGUE: The additional conditions can be established. The applicant may or may not agree with them. The purpose of a public hearing, again, is to bring forth proponents and opponents of an application. This is kind of like a trial, you know, you've got the defense, the prosecution.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Who's the jury?

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE SPEAKER: Two men.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Two men on a

UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: And the judge.

jury.

MR. HASKINS: What's going to happen when this property -- they developed property, most of it, like out from Arlington, in the '60's. How many houses were around it? Why wait until one of the

MR. ETTEHAD: (Interposing) You stop the progress. You break off the whole thing. If you take aerial photos of that area, where you are, nobody want to live, nobody. All they got is trailer and country shack.

This is the best part of this county. This

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10 11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23 24 man don't want to say that but that's the most desirable. That's where I live. That's where I live.

> MR. AUSTIN: Why I moved there.

MR. HASKINS: Why we all moved out there.

MR. ETTEHAD: There's a half a million dollar, million dollar house. As I said ten times, I've been approached by the biggest -- Chamberlain and McCrary, Faxon Gillis, they came to me and offered me ten to twelve thousand dollars per acre. I have a written contract for two and a half million dollars. I have a hundred and seventy acres of land including fifteen acre lake and you're going to come by and put your dumb gravel pit over there and call it Atoka Gravel Company.

MR. HASKINS: Atoka Gravel Pit.

MR. ETTEHAD: You ought to be ashamed of yourself. We are people, people left Memphis over here for peace, just to get away from it, and you come out here and destroy the best part of this town. There's a thousand acres. He didn't sell it because he didn't want to sell, this man didn't sell because it was in his family and you -- I only have a hundred and seventy acres land. Have you ever talked to me,

1

no. The guy was poking around to see what's going on and when I said what are you doing he starting cussing me and put a gun on me, one of your men working for you.

5

MR. PARKS: That's incorrect, sir.

6

MR. ETTEHAD: That's very correct.

7

MR. JOHNSON: Yes, sir.

8

MR. NICHOLS: I guess my question is, if

10

9

one person, other than these two gentlemen, say that

you've got so many people here and I have not heard

11

they want it, these people do not, and as far as I'm

12

concerned when you annexed us, you started working

13

for us. And by you working for us, if we say we

14

don't want it out there, then you should take that

15

and at least give us a hundred and eighty days like this gentleman said, so that we can at least study it

16

and they can make improvements to, say, to impress

17 18

us.

MR. SHINOSKY: And they could have another

MR. NICHOLS: I mean I think that's only

20

19

unbiased, you know, look at it.

21

fair. And if you're going to sit there and say,

22

well, we're making the decision tonight and, yes,

2324

we're going to go with it, then you're looking at no

(Off the record Board discussion)

24

Mr. JOHNSON: We're going to delay this, we're going to reset this meeting for approximately thirty days.

MR. SHINOSKY: You didn't answer my question. Why can't we delay it? Why the rush for thirty days? Why can't we do sixty?

MR. ETTEHAD: They got twenty years.

MR. HASKINS: So what's the difference if we go a little further so we can get all of our ducks in a row.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: It takes more than thirty days. I've seen people build a house and they can't get the loan application in thirty days.

MR. TICKLE: That's right.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: You still didn't answer our question. Why can't we do it later than thirty days.

(Whereupon, numerous individuals spoke simultaneously)

MR. WILLIFORD: Mark, we do have an obligation to these property owners and we have to start our State permit.

MR. ETTEHAD: Can we hear what that was?

MR. AUSTIN: I say if the company has an

interest in us they would go a hundred and eighty days and wouldn't have no problem with that.

MR. WILLIFORD: We have an issue insofar as we have to apply for the State permit and we have to have a permit before we apply for the State permit, and we also have an obligation to the people we've leased from, we can do it within a certain time frame. So, yes, sir, it is a time issue, although the construction, you're right, will be eighteen months.

MR. JOHNSON: Okay. We're going to set the meeting for June $29^{\rm th}$, the last Thursday in June at 6:00 o'clock.

(Adjournment)

CERTIFICATE OF COURT REPORTER

| STATE | OF | TENNESSEE |
|-------|----|-----------|
| | | |

COUNTY OF SHELBY

I, Carolyn D. Lepard, Court Reporter and Notary Public, do hereby certify that the foregoing proceedings were recorded by me in shorthand, and taped, and subsequently reduced to typewriting under my supervision, and contains all the proceedings propounded which occurred this 18th day of May, 2006.

I further certify that I am not related to nor employed by any of the parties and have no interest in the outcome of same.

COURT REPORTER & NOTARY PUBLIC AT LARGE

MY COMMISSION EXPIRES

October 29, 2008

| | | | , |
|--|--|--|---|
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |