

FLORIDA INLAND NAVIGATION DISTRICT



To: All FIND Commissioners
From: Mark Crosley, Executive Director *MC*
Date: October 10, 2018

Subject: October 08, 2018 Palm Beach Reach III South Maintenance Dredging Bid Results

COMMISSIONERS

DON DONALDSON
CHAIR
ST. LUCIE COUNTY

J. CARL BLOW
VICE-CHAIR
ST. JOHNS COUNTY

MICHAEL O'STEEN
TREASURER
DUVAL COUNTY

FRANK GERNERT
SECRETARY
BROWARD COUNTY

T. SPENCER CROWLEY, III
MIAMI-DADE COUNTY

DONALD J. CUOZZO
MARTIN COUNTY

CHARLES C. ISIMINGER
PALM BEACH COUNTY

SUSANNE McCABE
VOLUSIA COUNTY

JON NETTS
FLAGLER COUNTY

JERRY H. SANSOM
BREVARD COUNTY

LYNN A. WILLIAMS
NASSAU COUNTY

VACANT
INDIAN RIVER COUNTY

MARK T. CROSLEY
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

JANET ZIMMERMAN
ASSISTANT EXECUTIVE
DIRECTOR

Attached you will find the bid results for the referenced project, as well as Taylor Engineer's analysis summary of the bid submittals. The two apparent lowest bidders have been deemed "non-responsive" for reasons explained in Mr. Scarborough's letter dated October 10, 2018.

The third apparent lowest bidder, Orion Marine Construction has been deemed responsive and is familiar with this type of project, demonstrating extensive experience in this field. The District's legal counsel has been in conference with staff and the District's engineer and concurs with the bid result determination.

Therefore, staff is recommending the Board approve Orion Marine Construction as the responsive low-bidder for the Palm Beach Reach III South Maintenance Dredging Project. Staff recommends awarding the base bid (\$4,294,500 for the dredging project only) and separately contracting for the alternate bid (AT&T cable removal).

These results and recommendations will also be distributed at the Board meeting for your perusal. Please contact me if you have any questions or need additional information. Thank you.



October 10, 2018

Mr. Mark Crosley
 Executive Director
 Florida Inland Navigation District
 1314 Marcinski Road
 Jupiter, FL 33477

Re: Bid Review - Intracoastal Waterway Maintenance Dredging; South of Port of Palm Beach
 Palm Beach County, Florida

Dear Mr. Crosley:

On October 8, 2018, the Florida Inland Navigation District (FIND) received six bid packages for the Intracoastal Waterway (ICWW) maintenance dredging project in Palm Beach County. The bid values ranged from \$2,309,900 to \$7,237,725. The low bid — which applied a combination of mechanical and hydraulic dredging — was approximately 40% below Taylor Engineering’s estimates of \$3,872,250 for mechanical and \$3,920,550 for hydraulic dredging. **Table 1** summarizes the received bids. The three lowest bids were submitted by Brance Diversified, Arbor Tree & Land (ATL), and Orion Marine Construction (Orion). Brance Diversified (\$2,309,900) and ATL (\$3,899,000) provided the two lowest bids; however, we noted multiple deficiencies in their bid packages and deemed both bids non-responsive.

Table 1. Summary of Received Bids for the ICWW Maintenance Dredging Project

RANK	RESPONSIVE BIDDER	CONTRACTOR	BASE BID	ALTERNATE BID	TOTAL	BID PACKAGE REVIEW COMMENTS	
1	No	BRANCE DIVERSIFIED	\$2,219,900	\$90,000	\$2,309,900	BID FORM, Similar Projects	Bidder did not include three similar projects within the last three years. One of the bidder’s projects (Sebastian Harbor Inlet) was dated November 2007.
						BID FORM, Bidders Plan	The provided Bidders Plan did not meet the following minimum requirements. No. 3 (assurance that the contractor can complete the work within the given amount of time), No. 4 (assurance that the work can be performed with minimum impact to water quality and within the stated permit conditions), No. 5 (description of how quality control will be achieved, conducted, and maintained throughout the project duration), and No. 6 (estimate of weekly productivity) were not addressed in the Bidders Plan.
2	No	ARBOR TREE & LAND	\$3,824,000	\$75,000	\$3,899,000	BID FORM	Bidder used incorrect/outdated form; it did not use the updated Bid Form from Addendum No. 2.
						BID FORM, Similar Projects	Bidder did not include three similar projects within the last three years. One of its projects (FDOT & Palm Beach Wetland Mitigation Project) was dated 2014.
						BID SCHEDULE	Bidder used incorrect/outdated schedule; it did not use the updated Bid Schedule from Addendum No. 2.
3	Yes	ORION MARINE CONSTRUCTION	\$4,294,500	\$200,000	\$4,494,500	--	--

Table 1. Summary of Received Bids for the ICWW Maintenance Dredging Project (continued)

RANK	RESPONSIVE BIDDER	CONTRACTOR	BASE BID	ALTERNATE BID	TOTAL	BID PACKAGE REVIEW COMMENTS	
4	Yes	CASHMAN DREDGING	\$6,907,150	\$95,000	\$7,002,150	--	--
5	Yes	WEEKS MARINE	\$6,800,000	\$225,000	\$7,025,000	--	--
6	Yes	FERREIRA CONSTRUCTION	\$7,201,750	\$35,975	\$7,237,725	--	--

At a total bid price of \$4,494,500, Orion’s bid package includes the required Bid Form, Bid Schedule, Bid Bond, Public Entity Crime Statement, and the Affidavit for Surety Company. Notably, Orion’s bid package is complete and well organized. The detail included in Orion’s Bidders Plan demonstrates a thorough understanding of the project and provides Taylor Engineering a high level of confidence in Orion’s understanding of the methodology, operations, and challenges incumbent in the ICWW maintenance dredging project. Therefore, we deem Orion the qualified, responsible, and responsive Bidder presenting the lowest bid. Orion also included a copy of its State of Florida General Contractor (No. CGC1511169) license. As of October 9, no official complaints against this license appear on the Florida Department of Business & Professional Regulation website (<https://www.myfloridalicense.com/>).

As evidence of its qualifications, Orion submitted three required similar projects (completed within the past three years) and appropriate project references for evaluation. All three project descriptions — United States Army Corps of Engineers (USACE) Jacksonville District Tampa Harbor Maintenance Dredging, Port Tampa Bay Navigational Improvements, and Mississippi Department of Environmental Quality Sound Berm Construction — cited mechanical dredging of sediments of variable depth (maintenance and new work) dredging and environmental protection components. Our review also included a telephone discussion (with one of their three listed project references) with Mr. Patrick Blair, Tampa Port Authority. Mr. Blair indicated that they have had a very positive working relationship with Orion.

Finally, Taylor Engineering reviewed the individual bid items and concluded Orion’s bid is balanced. The main difference (\$622,250) between the Engineer’s Opinion of Probable Cost (\$3,872,250 for mechanical dredging) and Orion’s bid of \$4,494,500 are discrepancies in the mobilization/demobilization and alternate bid item. Given Orion’s Tampa, Florida headquarters, the bid mobilization/demobilization costs are reasonable. However, Orion’s alternate bid item (utility line removal) cost appears excessive relative to the likely cost for FIND or AT&T to mobilize a separate contractor to remove the decommissioned utility line.

We recommend that FIND (1) award the base bid (in the amount of \$4,294,500) to Orion and (2) due to the excessive cost of the alternate bid item (totaling \$200,000), determine a different avenue (potentially outside this contract) to remove the decommissioned utility line. Please contact me at (904) 731-7040 with any questions or concerns.

Sincerely,



Jerry Scarborough, P.E.
 Senior Advisor

FLORIDA INLAND NAVIGATION DISTRICT
1314 Marcinski Road
Jupiter, FL 33477

MEETING MINUTES
PB SOUTH DREDGING PROJECT BID OPENING
PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA

OCTOBER 08, 2018

A Public Meeting was held pursuant to Florida Statutes Section 255.0518 on October 8, 2018, 2:00 p.m. to open bid packages for the PB South Dredging Project. Glen Scambler, Director of Finance, FIND called the meeting to order at 2:00 p.m. Those in attendance were Jose Luis Quinones with Brance Diversified, Inc.; Clinton Hodges ATL Diversified; Frank Wirz with Orion Marine; Jerrid King with Cashman; Mike Ciabatteria with Ferreria Construction; Yehya Siddiqui with Taylor Engineering and Mark Tamblyn, with FIND.

Mr. Scambler verified that each bid package was received in accordance with the Instructions to Bidders.

Mr. Scambler then opened each bid package and read aloud the name of the bid company, as follows:

NAME OF BID COMPANY

Brance Diversified, Inc.	\$2,219, 900.00 ALT \$90,000.00 \$2,309,900.00
ATL Diversified	\$ 3,824,000.00 ALT \$75,000.00 \$3,899, 000.00
Orion Marine Construction	\$ 4, 294, 500.00 ALT \$200,00.00 \$4,494,500.00
Cashman Dredging	\$ 6, 907, 150.00 ALT \$95,000.00 \$7,002.150.00
Weeks Marine	\$ 6, 800, 000.00 ALT \$225,000.00 \$ 7, 025, 000.00
Ferreria Construction	\$ 7,201,750.00 ALT \$35,975.00 \$7,237,725.00

There being no other business, Mr. Scambler adjourned the meeting at 2:25 p.m.



Mark Tamblyn
Field Projects Coordinator

**PALM BEACH SOUTH DREDGING PROJECT
PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA**

October 8, 2018

Bid List

NAME OF FIRM	PROJECT BID
BRANCE DIVERSIFIED	\$ 2,219,900.00 ALT \$90,000.00 \$2,309, 900.00
ATL DIVERSIFIED	\$ 3,824,000.00 ALT \$75,000.00 \$ 3,899,000.00
ORION MARINE CONSTRUCTION	\$4, 294, 500.00 ALT \$200,000.00 \$4,494,500.00
CASHMAN DREDGING	\$6, 907, 150.00 ALT \$95,000.00 \$7, 002,150.00
WEEKS MARINE	\$6, 800, 000.00 ALT \$225,000.00 \$ 7, 025, 000.00
FERRERIA CONSTRUCTION	\$7, 201,750.00 ALT \$35, 975.00 \$7,237,725.00